

CAMBRIDGE SCHOOL COMMITTEE

(Official Minutes)

Regular Meeting January 19, 2021

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Vice Chair Bowman, Member Fantini, Member Rachel, Member Rojas, Member

Weinstein, Member Wilson, Mayor Siddiqui

Also Present: Superintendent Dr. Kenneth N. Salim, Nuriel Vera-Degraff, Anais Killian, Student

School Committee Representatives

Mayor Siddiqui in the Chair

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

The Chair provided a statement to the public regarding Governor Charlie Baker's Executive Order on guidelines for remote participation and then read the call of the meeting.

The meeting proceeded to the first order of business with a roll call vote for the purpose of a sound check: Member Rojas PRESENT; Member Rachel PRESENT; Member Weinstein PRESENT; Member Wilson PRESENT; Vice Chair Bowman PRESENT; Member Fantini PRESENT; Mayor Siddiqui PRESENT.

Opening comments by Mayor Siddiqui began with acknowledging that these are extremely trying times and the Committee is facing very difficult decisions that are tied to enormous emotional issues. We all have opinions, feelings and Covid anxiety. We are all entitled to our thoughts so lets' treat each other in a respectful and civil manner.

1. Public Comment:

The following individuals were heard:

- Rua Kelly, Upton Street, supports the reopening plan and #21-27.
- Eleanor Actipus, Whittemore Ave, supports #21-29.
- Patrick Barrett, Pleasant Street, supports opening statement by Chair & supports reopening plan
- Kate Skubecz, Thorndike Street, supports #21-19 and #21-27
- Pia Cisternino, Holworthy Street, supports reopening plan and supports remote teaching
- Kris Dickson, Fresh Pond Pkwy, supports #21-19 expanded reopening plan
- Cecilia Cotta-Ramusino, Broadway, in support of school reopening, thanked all for their hard work
- Emily Chang, supports expanded reopening plan, thanked the teachers that have been in-person
- Maria Cortes, Cambridge Parkway, supports reopening plan, compromise and to work together
- Marta Bianciardi, Union Street, supports #21-19 and #21-27 supports in-person learning
- Vanessa Ruget, Appleton Street, supports #21-19 and support of IEP students
- Hector Penagos, Harvard Street, supports in-person learning, grateful to the in-person teachers
- Danielle Greshock, Thorndike Street, supports in-person learning, feels forgotten as a woman
- Kristin Michaud, Aberdeen Ave., supports reopening and autonomy for 4th and 5th grade schools
- Dan Monahan, Lexington Ave., cautions reopening before teachers are ready to return
- Marcelo Montorzi, Harvard Street supports full in-person learning
- Sara Engel, Fountain Terrace, opposed to #21-19, teachers have not been listened to at all
- Keith Ericson, Concord Ave., supports in-person learning and required surveillance testing

- Whitney Schutzbank, Norfolk Street, supports in-person learning
- Kerry Tanwar, Churchill Ave., supports in-person learning
- Rachel Dorr, Lee Street, concerned about bringing students and personnel together in school
- Edward Naef, Dana Street, supports in-person learning
- Guilia Fulci, Broadway, supports in-person learning
- Andrew King, Essex Street, opposed to the reopening plan, has many concerns
- Cheryl Keane, Plymouth Street, supports in-person learning
- Erus Grandi, Maple Ave., Open schools
- Alisa Khan, Third Street, thanked all in-person workers, spoke to educators about fear
- Gerardo Carcamo, Putnam Ave., supports in-person learning
- Tiber Dalton, Franklin Street, supports an alternative to in-person learning, supports small classes
- Julio Lumbreras, Hingham Street, supports expanded in-person learning & #21-27

On a motion by Member Rachel, seconded by Member Wilson, on the following roll call vote, it was voted to close public comment: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

2. Student School Committee Report:

Member Vera-Degraff reported CRLS finals for semester 1 are next week, with a maximum of two exams per day, 2nd semester starts in two weeks.

Member Killian reported VPA Winter Festival is still ongoing, as for sports, all games are recorded and can be seen live. All students and families that clicked yes believe they are now automatically going to be in-person learners. Many caregivers have no knowledge of tiers, most of the student population feels they are coming back in person if they want to.

Member Wilson asked how the student representatives intend to inform peers and parents of the tiers.

Member Killian stated they plan on creating a website and putting the updates online and in the Register Forum. They would like very much to send the information to caregivers if they could access their email addresses.

Member Vera-DeGraff added that they also plan on posting the student updates on social media.

Member Wilson suggested a way to reach more families is to use the texting feature google mind and robo calls. She offered the support of the Committee of the Whole.

Vice Chair Bowman celebrated our Student School Committee Members thanking them for their leadership.

Member Rojas also thanked our student members and he stated that he was able to see several of the VPA performances. These extra-curricular activities are critically important for our students.

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

- July 14, 2020 Special Meeting
- November 17, 2020 Regular Meeting
- January 5, 2021 Regular Meeting

On a motion by Member Rojas, seconded by Member Fantini, on the following roll call vote, it was voted to accept the Minutes as presented: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

4. Reconsiderations: None

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:

#21-14 Joint Motion by Member Wilson and Member Rachel

Whereas: The Cambridge Public Schools District Plan commits to supporting the whole child; and

Whereas: Children's' basic needs must be met if they are to reach their full potential; and

Whereas: The Commonwealth's data from 2019 reflects that over one quarter of Cambridge Public

School scholars are economically disadvantaged and nearly one half have high needs; and

Whereas: The pandemic has resulted in a dramatic increase of families struggling to secure basic needs, and underscored how positive partnerships between schools and families are critical to reimagining the school system post-pandemic; and

Whereas: The CPSD Food and Nutrition Services Department, Food for Free, The Spot, individual family liaisons and teachers, and others are working to support students and families; now therefore be it **Resolved**: That at the Regular meeting on March 2, 2021, the Superintendent will report to the School Committee and the public on existing systems for how the district identifies and responds to the needs of scholars and families in the district; and be it further

Resolved: That, at that meeting, the Superintendent's team will bring to the School Committee recommendations for measurable, actionable strategies the department could take for proactively attending to the needs of scholars and families. (Fantini, 1-5-2021)

Member Wilson commented that this motion is self-explanatory, she thanked educators, family liaisons and Lily Rayman-Reed, Debbie Bonilla and Robin Harris and school staff in general for all of their work in communicating with families and their variety of needs to understand the school system and how to navigate through the system with a more sustainable approach.

Member Rachel also thanked staff members and spoke to the fact that they want all families to be able to engage with staff for all needs to promote productivity.

Dr. Salim added that through the Community Relations Sub-Committee with Robin Harris and her team, there will be reports coming from the Family Liaisons. He added the DHSP can also support this motion.

Vice Chair Bowman stated the motion listed many broad issues. She asked for clarity to identify the needs specifically in order to know exactly what the district is providing.

Member Wilson explained the motion being broad because of these unprecedented times it is too challenging to define them all. She would like to keep it as it is and let deeper conversations come out during a Sub-Committee.

Member Rachel agreed that it is broad, they need more data from the Family Liaisons in order to know how to define needs, adding that she does not have any problems referring it.

Member Fantini motioned to refer this to the Community Relations Sub-Committee in order to better define areas of need.

On a motion by Member Fantini, seconded by Member Wilson, on the following roll call vote, **#21-14** was removed from the Calendar, adopted and referred to the Communications and Community Relations Sub-Committee: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddigui YEA.

6. Awaiting Reports:

#20-308 Joint Motion by Member Fantini and Mayor Siddiqui,

Whereas, the Cambridge Public Schools participate in the Journey into Education and Teaching Program, known as JET, to provide a pathway at little cost for paraprofessionals to get their bachelor's degrees and Massachusetts teacher licensures; and

Whereas JET (www.jetintoteaching.org) supports the goals of building local teacher pipelines and developing an educator workforce that reflects the racial, cultural, and linguistic diversity of our students; and

Whereas JET provides the program structure for recruitment and support such as: advising, guiding in application procedures for college admission and financial aid, participating in cohort groups, providing local educator mentors, and professional and career development opportunities; and

Whereas Cambridge must commit to providing and compensating mentors as part of our commitment to JET Paraprofessionals; and

Whereas JET is an education program of the Massachusetts Foundation for Teaching and Learning; and Whereas Massachusetts is unique in providing a state education grant that funds the undergraduate education of employed eligible paraprofessionals who commit to becoming teachers; and Whereas, JET already has demonstrated a record of success; and

Whereas meeting application deadlines is critical; now therefore be it

Resolved that the Superintendent collaborate with JET and report on how the program will operate in Cambridge.

Member Fantini stated that this program is ready to launch for our paraprofessionals to get their Bachelors' degree, the Superintendent needs to get someone to work with JET, the person who is running this JET program is all set to go.

#20-309 Joint Motion by Mayor Siddiqui, Member Fantini and Member Wilson,

Whereas equity and access are of highest priority for the Cambridge Public Schools and Cambridge School Committee, including postsecondary success for all of our scholars; and

Whereas extensive research nationally found that Early College is a promising model that narrows educational opportunity gaps, and that existing programs were a powerful foundation from which to build a broader statewide Early College Initiative; and

Whereas the Massachusetts boards of Elementary and Secondary Education and Higher Education jointly launched an initiative in 2018 to establish an Early College designation for districts specifically attempting to recruit underrepresented students, to allow cohort-based models that provide high-need and low-income students with the opportunity to complete college level academic coursework on a clearly articulated pathway while simultaneously gaining exposure to a variety of career opportunities; and Whereas 37 different high schools and 19 colleges and universities have partnered to offer Early College

programs to thousands of students across the commonwealth, with enrollment projected to hit 4,200 students in FY21 and students earning an estimated 25,000 college credits, securing tuition and fee savings at an estimated \$5.4 million; and

Whereas the Cambridge Rindge and Latin School offers a Dual Enrollment program in partnership with Bunker Hill Community College but has not received the state's Early College Designation, which requires very specific advising metrics and a scope and sequence demonstrating that a school can offer at least 12 fully transferable college credits; and

Whereas Dual Enrollment, while often conflated with Early College, serves any students who self-select and therefore are already high-performing; now therefore be it

Resolved that the Superintendent work with the Principal of CRLS to provide a report on the current participation of the Dual Enrollment program by demographic, courses, and number of credits by year since its inception before the next Regular Meeting of the School Committee on Tuesday, January 5th, 2021.

Member Fantini stated that **#20-309** should be ready to come off of the Agenda soon also, adding that B. Kimmerman has been doing a lot of outreach in this area to make sure this program will be a success.

Mayor Siddiqui stated that the Committee of the Whole takes all of the public comments, testimonies and emails that are coming their way to heart. They use all of the comments to make decisions. One School Committee duty is to serve the children of this district, that does not mean that the Committee Members

do not care about the teachers. There are on-going negotiations with the CEA that keep the Members and the Superintendent from responding to emails and as a result, the emails are very adversarial.

Superintendent Salim stated none of this process has been easy and the decisions are hard also, this evening he is not going to go through all of the details that have been shared already. Dr. Lisa Dobberteen and Nurse Tracy Rose-Tynes, and a few others will be joining the presentation.

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

The Presentation is online and can be viewed

 $\underline{https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0?ui=2\&ik=0ef808350d\&attid=0.1\&permmsgid=msg-f:1689349767364903649\&th=1771c6a9b12c82e1\&view=att\&disp=inline\&realattid=f_kk4gzrz60$

Dr. Dobberteen shared some important public health updates on the variant, testing and the vaccine. We are still waiting to hear from Gov. Baker for when the vaccine will be available for phase 2. They have perfected a good plan from when they vaccinated first responders. They have also planned a lot of listening conversations to answer questions about the vaccine. They are working on their testing program for students and tweaking their staff testing availability. They will be testing in all schools soon. High School students can be tested when they are participating in in-person learning. Remote students will not be tested while remote. As far as the new variant, B.1.1.7, the strain from the U.K., has been identified in MA. This variant is highly transmissible, however she believes the vaccine will be just as effective on this new variant. The new variants in S. Africa and Brazil have not been identified in MA yet.

The Chair opened the floor to the Members for questions, discussions and concerns:

Member Rachel asked if our precautions need to change due to the new variant.

- Dr. Dobberteen responded that the UK did not have the same high level of mitigation strategies
 that we have in place. We are going to continue to strengthen our health and facility policies and
 procedures manual, and continue to use high quality masks and review our ventilation systems in
 all areas.
- **Member Rachel** asked if we have all of our data by race, IEP, free and reduced lunch. Superintendent Salim responded in the affirmative and will be available in the upcoming weeks.

Member Fantini asked for some highlights of what the plan will look like?

• Dr. Dobberteen explained that in conjunction with the Galleria Mall, they will have space for testing with social distancing, for people to come in, be vaccinated, go to a waiting area, and then check out with a vaccine card and make an appointment to come back in a month.

Member Fantini asked about demographics at CRLS. Are the number of students that want to return at a low number?

- Dr. Salim answered that enrollment will depend on the staffing as to how many students can come back.
- Principal Smith added that they are looking at numbers that are lower than we expected and there are still some demographic groups we still have not heard from (mainly 9th graders).

Member Fantini also asked what percentage of our students are in school now.

• Dr. Salim responded that he will get back to the Committee with an answer.

Vice Chair Bowman mentioned the fact that our food service workers have never left the building, they have been "on the front line" since the beginning, and asked how do we prioritize them.

• Dr. Dobberteen answered that they have not figured out the details of how they will administer the vaccine yet but they are working on fine tuning the rollout.

Vice Chair Bowman asked how the state and local school districts are considering the roll out for those that live and work in the school community as opposed to those who only work in the school community.

• Dr. Dobberteen answered that she believes that the vaccine will be available for all of those that work in the school community, where they live, so far, is not going to present a challenge.

Vice Chair Bowman asked about the challenges with the number of vaccines that are available.

- Dr. Dobberteen answered that they expect vaccine production and distribution nationwide will happen in a more transparent and ramped up fashion. She doesn't foresee any obstacles.
- Mayor Siddiqui stated that more vaccines, i.e. a Johnson and Johnson vaccine and the Oxford vaccine will be coming through the pipeline to be approved by the FDA and are only one dose.

Vice Chair Bowman asked what necessary behavior should we practice once a significant number of staff have been vaccinated since children still will not have access to the vaccine

• Dr. Dobberteen answered adults should continue to wear masks, practice hand hygiene and distancing. She emphasized that life will not go back to normal until we have herd immunity.

Member Weinstein asked about a statement made at public comment on vulnerable family members and the remote learning experience.

- Mayor Siddiqui answered that some of these issues are in bargaining and we cannot speak further on these issues.
- Lisa Richardson, Chief Talent Officer, answered that the leave policy was required to shift and now denies certain accommodations for a household family member that may be at risk, we are no longer granting that accommodation for about 75 staff members. HR initially approved all of them; now, looking at other districts and witnessing the struggles for staffing JK-3 models at our schools, we need the vast majority of our staff to return to the buildings in order to expand inperson learning. They had to shift away from some of their practices for granting remote accommodation requests. They are still granting and have recently granted 192 childcare requests, 34 medical requests, and 272 personal requests. They denied 75 requests for at risk household family members.

Member Rojas asked what are we doing to coordinate with other partners for help on how we stop the fear of in-person schooling of our staff members?

- Dr. Salim responded that partnering with others to have community based Covid conversations will help answer questions both inside and outside of schools. He is excited about engaging with families as well.
- Dr. Dobberteen intends to partner the Public Health Department with the School Department the Mayor's Office and the City's Public Information Dept. to create other venues for questions and answers.

Member Rojas asked if testing will remain voluntary or become mandatory for children

 Dr. Dobberteen stated that they will be asking parents for permission to test their children while they attend school.

Member Rojas asked how will we expand on non-sports related extra curricula activities and clubs

- Principal Coplan-Newfield explained that planning at the beginning of spring may be the best time for rollout; adding they have no plans to expand virtual clubs to in-person clubs.
- Principal Smith added that clubs and groups are meeting virtually now. They are being very careful of the in-person meetings outside. As the weather gets warmer, they will take more advantage of those opportunities; he is confident spaces will open up as the weather gets better.

Member Wilson thanked everyone and asked if the surgical masks and what we have are the same?

 Dr. Dobberteen explained that thanks to Dr. Crittendon, CPSD has purchased all high quality masks. There are also a lot of face shields purchased to provide a second layer of protection from the pandemic.

Member Wilson asked why an educator was not able to get a mask and are we getting any mask donations from the public?

• Mr. Maloney answered that he only knows of an email from a remote teacher that was not able to get a mask. CPSD has been focusing on in-person staff. At this point, we do not need or want to take masks that may not meet our standards, we will continue to rely on Dr. Crittendon's advice.

Member Wilson asked what percentage of families have responded to the survey? She emphasized that our remote program remains as robust as possible – some families have strong fears and are not sending their children back into the classroom.

- Dr. Salim answered over 50% of our families have responded
- Dr. Pinkus-Brown answered that about 1000 families have not responded to the survey, if no response, CPSD carries forward with their current mode. They did not want to provide preliminary data, as more numbers are coming in. Some schools only heard from a handful and others had 90% and 80% responses.

Member Wilson stated that many families are keeping their children at home because of fear. She asked if there is a decision making structure that includes educators.

- Dr. Salim answered yes and explained they can be found on the safety, health and facilities
 working group, the Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee has public comment for teachers
 input, he explained further that his presentations go into more detail about these complexities of
 planning.
- Principal Williams answered that it is difficult without knowing staffing and enrollment data; most
 meetings have centered around obstacles that need to be overcome, mainly fear. Staffing issues
 have been examined logistically in terms of recess, lunch, classrooms, busing and
 entering/exiting the building. He will continue to engage staff to get to a positive end.
- Principall Coplan-Newfield spoke on the middle grade issues; what teachers can control in their spaces with multiple sections moving at the same time. He needs a lot of time to get the schedule correct and then more time for meetings to address worries and fears. Logistical obstacles are huge when it comes to changing classes. He needs to physically sit with his teachers and have them name their fears so he can definitely address it and attempt to solve it. Telling teachers CPSD has superior masks and other districts are open does not dissolve personal fears. Admitted it is a slow process.
- Principal Yung added that it takes a lot of time to figure out families' desires and selections. They
 have built their schedules for JK-3. That has to change. There are many variables that can lead
 to the scheduling process to begin.
- Principal Smith answered that the fear is not irrational. Until the fear is focused on, we are not going to move forward. Our staff do not understand how in-person will look or how in-person will work. Staff wants to talk about vaccination and testing and it feels dehumanizing when their lives are on the line and they are only offered the choice of schedule A or schedule B. Their main concerns remain vaccinations and testing, they don't want to be in their spaces yet. The pandemic is debilitating and we have to pay attention to the fears of our staff.

Member Wilson asked about the EOCC, and working with that staff

• Dr. Salim answered that the infection control teams are launching at all of our schools. Some of the issues raised by the principals are also part of the bargaining process. EOCC educators and mental health needs were brought up as to what it looks like for staff in particular.

Member Wilson asked Ms. Richardson if there is a timeline on snatching away remote accommodations?

• Ms. Richardson answered that the approvals and/or the denials for accommodations will be for the remainder of the school year. Adding that HR will do a better job of communicating this to all educators and staff.

Member Wilson strongly emphasized that the Committee of the Whole is tasked with the extremely hard job of providing this *or* that instead of this *and* that. Centering the needs of our students is the highest priority, but we cannot run schools without educators.

7b. CPS District Plan: None

7c. Consent Agenda:

the Superintendent's Agenda was brought forward for discussion and adoption. Member Rachel removed **#21-19**. Member Wilson removed **#21-21**. Member Fantini removed **#21-23**.

On the following roll call vote, items **#21-20**, **#21-22** and **#21-24** were adopted: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-20, **Day & Residential Program Services** not available from the Cambridge School Department, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of

the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the general fund and/or Grand Fund Budget.

#21-22, Contract Award, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for plumbing supplies & equipment, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Metropolitan Pipe, 30 Innerbelt Road, Somerville, for the period of January 1, 2021 to June 30, 2021 in the amount of \$50,000.00

#21-24, Approval of Gift to Cambridge Public Schools of an in-kind donation of 200 paper bags from Trader Joe's to the Tobin Montessori school for sending home remote learning materials to students be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve the above donations as described.

8. Non-Consent Agenda:

#21-19, Approval of the Expanded In-Person Learning Plan for Grades 4-12 Beginning March 1, 2021 be adopted as follows: that the School Committee approves the expanded in-person learning plan for grades 4-12 as detailed in the January 12, 2021 presentation.

Discussion followed on #21-19.

Member Rachel motioned the following amendment:

Amend recommendation to state, "The School Committee approves the expanded in-person learning plan as detailed in the January 12, 2021 presentation with three additional requirements listed in the description below." (italics are new)

- Remote classrooms will, at a minimum, maintain current levels of dedicated staffing, resources and support, and will not be negatively impacted by plans for expanded in-person learning.
- Principals will work with their school teams and communities to develop and implement their own staffing models for remote and in-person learning that fit these requirements, with principals having decision-making authority.
- Principals will submit their school-level plans to the School Committee for review at the February 2 regular meeting.

Member Rachel stated that things are worse than they need to be. We can do better by our educators. We are going to risk harm no matter how we proceed, we can try to minimize risk as much as we can and we still have to move forward regardless. Her amendments still leave a lot to be desired, however she feels it helps.

Member Weinstein commented that it is distracting to hear that the educators to not feel heard or included in the planning process. He is a former educator and a parent of two children so he understands all of the needs. He thanked the teachers and staff for their hard work. These amendments are to ensure the teacher collaborator co-design process that should have happened before will happen now, these amendments are a good model to do that.

Member Wilson stated that collaboration is key. We do not have a definition of what building trust looks like. We need to start our work at defining trust. If we do not work together, we will continue to be divided and ultimately it will hurt our children the most. We need to define co-design and we need to do better.

Dr. Salim responded to the amendments stating he appreciates the spirit behind these amendments. He questioned what power-sharing means and what co-design means. He has tried to incorporate teacher voices and building leaders voices into his decision making process and sought to make adjustments

along the way based on what he hears from the CEA president. He spoke to the first bullet with particular attention to the language of *maintain current levels of dedicated staffing*. By definition, if we create an in-person cohort to be added to the existing remote cohort, automatically we necessitate a different level of staffing. The current level cannot be maintained, nor should it be. There will be different ratios.

Member Rachel motioned a 2nd amendment to the 1st amendment: *maintain current levels of student/educator ratios*

Dr. Salim did agree with the 2nd amendment adding *to the extent possible*. Moving on to the other bullets, Dr. Salim brought up the fact that the School Committee role and their authority is not to direct staff. School Committee needs to work through the Superintendent. Schools should be allowed to maintain their autonomy and innovation while the Superintendent, along with his staff; namely Dr. Gittens and Dr. Madera, maintain the guardrails. He discussed how hard It is because we don't know what we don't know, however, it is his role as a Superintendent to work with the leadership team. He further discussed how CPS is not a group of Charter Schools; we are a district. As for the 3rd bullet, it is not feasible for School Committee to have a review and approval process on this level. It is the Superintendent's job to direct his leadership team. There can be many different approaches that allow for autonomy in school communities, all of which are within his realm. The Superintendent gives updates to the School Committee of all plans, and it is the Superintendent's role to approve the plans.

Member Rojas feels that teachers asking for stronger voices in decisions is valid and at the same time it makes a more complicated balancing act between management and staff; too much or too little power is a delicate issue. He was concerned about the amendments overstepping and, so he can support the amendments with the clarifications that Dr. Salim pointed out.

Vice Chair Bowman is worried about what is discussed in negotiations being included in these amendments which is why she cannot support the amendments; they align too much with what is going on privately. She spoke about a category four hurricane in her hometown in LA, resulting in a tree falling through her mothers' home, who is now displaced while her home is being rebuilt. Vice Chair Bowman's best friend is working through the aftermath of the hurricane and the on-going horrors of COVID as an inperson classroom teacher. She doesn't have testing, and they do not have many resources, but they are resilient. With all of the resources in Cambridge, we should have moved forward by now.

Member Fantini stated that if the Superintendent is okay with the first amendment, then he accepts it also. He worries about the other two. He discussed how the Superintendent should be bringing recommendations to the School Committee just like we handle our school improvement plans, the Superintendent should be the one bringing anything and everything to the Committee. On the third amendment, the Educational Reform Act gives principals an enormous amount of power; they should encourage collaboration, they are leaders. He stated that legally School Committee works with and through the Superintendent. We need to wordsmith all of these amendments to suit the Superintendent's needs; he is the only one we supervise and evaluate. The School Committee cannot change that structure.

Mayor Siddiqui stated that issues will come up in a pandemic, things are coming up in bargaining and some things we cannot fix. We need to settle for some compromises. We can edit these amendments in order to get them to pass as part of the recommendation.

Member Wilson stated that she wants to respect the Superintendents amendments to Member Rachel's amendment. She is curious as to why we would add *to the greatest extent possible*. Dr. Salim explained that it will not always be possible to split in-person learning and remote learning 50/50.

Member Weinstein added that we want to be clear that we maintain robust support for remote learning and noted the importance of it not becoming an afterthought.

Remote classrooms will, at a minimum, maintain current levels of dedicated staffing
student/educator ratios to the greatest extent possible, resources and support, and will not
be negatively impacted by plans for expanded in-person learning.

On a motion by Member Fantini, seconded by Mayor Siddiqui, the amendment to the first bullet of Member Rachel's amendment was voted to strike the language dedicated staffing, replace it with the language: **student/educator ratios to the greatest extent possible**: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman NAY; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

Second bullet of Member Rachel's amendment began as follows:

 Principals will work with their school teams and communities to develop and implement their own staffing models for remote and in-person learning that fit these requirements, with principals having decision-making authority

Member Rachel motioned, seconded by Member Wilson, to add at the end **and with full support** of the administration.

Dr. Salim asked for clarification. He stated that the School Committee should go through the Superintendent; there should not be a directive from the School Committee to the principals and/or staff, to do so is outside the boundaries of the Educational Reform Law.

Mayor Siddiqui pointed out that the principals did have a meeting requesting March 1st; as the expanded in-person learning date; and as a result, that is what the Superintendent has brought to the Committee of the Whole. The Committee worked on amending the next two bullets:

- Principals will work with their school teams and communities to develop and implement their own staffing models for remote and in-person learning that fit these requirements, with principals having decision-making authority
- Principals will submit their school-level plans to the School Committee for review at the February 2 regular meeting.

It was decided to amend the amendment of the 2nd bullet to insert the language *Through the Superintendent*, Principals will insert language *continue to* work with their school teams and communities to develop and implement their own staffing models for remote and in-person learning that fit these requirements, strike with principals having decision making authority insert *and further* (insert and amend third bullet), strike the language *Principals will submit*, replace the strike with *the Superintendent will bring a summary of their* school level plans to present to the School Committee strike for review at the February 2 regular meeting.

On the 2nd bulleted amendment: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman NAY; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

On Recommendation **#21-19**, as amended: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson NAY; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

That Superintendent's Recommendation #21-19, Approval of the Expanded In-Person Learning Plan for Grades 4-12 Beginning March 1, 2021 be adopted as amended: that the School Committee approves the expanded in-person learning plan for grades 4-12 as detailed in the January 12, 2021 presentation, with the two additional requirements listed in the description below:

Remote classrooms will, at a minimum, maintain current levels of student/educator ratios to the greatest extent possible, resources and support, and will not be negatively impacted by plans for expanded in-person learning. Through the Superintendent, Principals will continue to work with their school teams and
communities to develop and implement their own staffing models for remote and inperson learning that fit these requirements, and further; the Superintendent will bring a
summary of their school-level plans to present to the School Committee at the February 2
regular meeting.

#21-21, Contract Award, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for instructional services, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Navigation Games, 116 Henry St, for the period of January 1, 2021 to June 30, 2021 in the amount of \$32,600.

Discussion followed on #20-21

Member Wilson asked to hear from the Superintendent on how they intend to use this instructional service. She stated that there are mixed reviews about the services of this vendor.

Dr. Salim asked Dr. Turk speak to this.

Dr. Turk replied that they contracted with this vendor through the physical education department for the last five or six years for grades three across the district. Navigation Games contacted CPSD to partner with us to engage students in safe outdoor spaces (due to Covid-19) and worked with the physical education department for grades K through three, which resulted in an expansion of their services. They have staff that are trained in orienteering and leading the activities with our young people and have collaborated with our Physical Education Dept. to be able to implement the program. This contract is to support the expansion of the existing program for now until the end of the school year. It was clarified that this program is strictly outdoors and is not connected to their web based service.

Member Fantini supports this contract award and noted that parents have been asking for their kids to be outside; he looks forward to the success of this program.

Member Weinstein also supports this program. He is happy for the clarification that this is an outdoor experience.

Member Wilson would like to see this contract be extended beyond third grade.

On a motion by Mayor Siddiqui, seconded by Member Wilson, the Rules were suspended to extend the time of the meeting. On the following roll call vote, the meeting was extended to 11:00 p.m.: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

On the following roll call vote, #20-21 was adopted: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-23, Contract Award, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for musical equipment maintenance, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Gerry's Music Shop, 80 Lamb Street, South Hadley, for the period of January 1, 2021 to June 30, 2021 in the amount of \$27,102.00

Discussion followed on #21-23

Member Fantini stated that the music department will shortly have their instruments back from being cleaned, thanks to this vendor. Our students will be able to enjoy playing instruments again.

On the following roll call vote, #20-23 was adopted: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):

The School Committee Agenda was brought forward for discussion and adoption. Vice Chair Bowman removed all items.

#21-25 Joint Motion by Member Rachel, Member Fantini and Member Weinstein

Whereas: The Cambridge Public Schools are committed to preparing every student for postsecondary success; and

Whereas: The School Committee has expressed desire to see enhanced career pathways as well as expanded internship opportunities across our high schools; and

Whereas: The school department had planned to conduct a program review of the Rindge School of Technical Arts this school year, but was delayed due to the pandemic; and

Whereas: The School Committee is eager to follow-up on the conversation with RSTA leaders last spring, which covered preliminary reflections on the achievements and opportunities for strengthening RSTA, including how student enrollment in career and technical education pathways compares with the general CRLS population, how many students are provided with workplace learning experiences, how many Cambridge students are accessing career technical education in other Shared Occupational Learning Vocational Education Division (SOLVED) partnership districts, and how many students graduate with state or industry credentials; and

Whereas: The School Committee wants to explore how students could earn college credits while in high school; now therefore be it

Resolved: That by April 15, 2021, the Curriculum and Achievement Sub-Committee will convene a meeting to continue analysis of data and discuss a full review of the program.

Member Rachel stated this is a follow-up to a motion that was adopted last year, to strengthen the real life work experience while in school. Now that Covid-19 has disrupted everything, they are trying to bring it back to the forefront.

Member Fantini added that the RSTA Department needs to be reviewed so that students can begin to learn a living wage directly from high school. RSTA does a good job; and this is a time to examine the SOLVED collaborative and see how well we are doing in that area also.

Member Rojas asked why we need a motion; why didn't the Curriculum and Achievement Sub-Committee have this discussion and bring a recommendation to the Committee of the Whole.

#21-26 Joint Motion by Member Rojas, Member Rachel and Member Weinstein – calendared-Whereas: The Cambridge School Committee updated its health & safety framework on the basis of the Schools and Path to Zero report of Dr. Danielle Allen; and

Whereas: The report acknowledges that trust is necessary for the framework to work, and part of trust is clarity and transparency in decision-making; and

Whereas: The report calls for a Situation Room for In-person Learning; now therefore be it

Resolved: That the Superintendent reports at every regular meeting to the School Committee on the

decisions of the Situation Room for In-person Learning, and alerts the Committee immediately whenever the district disagrees with a recommendation from the Cambridge Public Health Department.

Discussion followed on item #21-26.

Member Rojas stated that the spirit of this motion is to provide a way for the community to learn about events that may arise in the Situation Room when the district does not agree with the health department.

Member Fantini asked what is the Situation Room?

Dr. Salim answered that the Situation Room is an administrative team that reviews all of the data used to make the decisions around quarantining. It is an information gathering process, working through the details from all schools and then making a decision.

Member Fantini iterated that the CPSD is not planning on disregarding any recommendations from the CPHD. The Cambridge Public Health Department has authority on health standards and CPSD will follow their recommendations.

Because Vice Chair Bowman wants the CPHD to explain the process they go through to make their decisions, she Calendared this Motion to be brought forward at the next Regular Meeting.

#21-27 Joint Motion by Mayor Siddiqui, Member Rojas and Vice Chair Bowman

Whereas: Providing the best education and ensuring the wellbeing of our scholars are the highest priorities of the Cambridge School Committee and CPS Administration; and

Whereas: The data shows extreme negative consequences of school closures on scholars' mental, physical, and academic wellbeing; and

Whereas There is growing evidence that more students can and must be brought back in-person with urgency; and

Whereas: The School Committee and Administration are committed to adaptability and quickly pivoting plans as necessary amid the COVID-19 pandemic; and

Whereas: CPSD must continuously revisit conditions and plan for further expansions; and

Whereas: While the current reopening model recommendation allows families to opt into in-person learning, not all scholars in the district are eligible due to staffing and space constraints; now therefore be it

Resolved: That the Superintendent work with his team to provide a report on what is and is not working with the existing model and the possibilities for subsequent expansions by Friday, April 2, 2021; and be it further

Resolved: That the Superintendent provide an update on the impact of vaccine rollouts on further inperson expansion planning by Friday, April 2, 2021.

Discussion followed on #21-27.

Mayor Siddiqui stated the intent of this Motion is about being prepared for areas of shifting between now and April. There are still questions and concerns and by April there should be some results of what is working and what is not working and CPSD can use the knowledge to make adjustments.

On the following roll call vote, #20-25 was adopted and referred to the Curriculum and Achievement Sub-Committee: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-28 Joint Motion by Member Weinstein, Member Rachel

Whereas: The health and safety of all Cambridge Public Schools students and staff is the highest priority and most important responsibility of the School Committee; and

Whereas: CPSD is currently offering in-person learning to some students and is working to expand inperson learning opportunities to more students; and

Whereas: CPSD staff, including teachers and support staff, are currently in-person supporting those students and more will need to be in-person for in-person learning to expand; and

Whereas: Surveillance testing is an effective way to limit the spread of COVID-19; now therefore be it

Resolved: That the Cambridge Public Schools will implement weekly mandatory COVID-19 surveillance testing for all in-person students at all age levels, following all relevant regulations, beginning as soon as possible for students currently in-person and put in place before additional students are brought in for inperson learning; and be it further

Resolved: That the Cambridge Public Schools will require weekly mandatory COVID-19 surveillance testing for all in-person staff, following all relevant regulations, beginning as soon as possible for staff currently in-person and put in place before additional staff are brought in for in-person learning; and be it further

Resolved: That COVID-19 testing will continue to be offered to all in-person staff twice weekly, with a requirement to participate at least once per week; and be it further

Resolved: That this will not change offerings nor protocols for symptomatic or exposure-related COVID-19 testing of students or staff.

Discussion followed on #21-28.

Mayor Siddiqui moved referral to the Superintendent

Member Weinstein is amenable to the referral

Member Rojas stated that some of these issues will be discussed at the Buildings & Grounds Sub-Committee with a recommendation to come before the Committee of the Whole

Vice Chair Bowman believes this motion undermines #21-27 they just voted on

Mayor Siddiqui believes it comports with plans to be put in place before in-person happens but not to delay anything

Member Fantini seconded referral to the Superintendent.

After a short discussion, it was agreed that item #21-28 be referred to the Superintendent.

On the following roll call vote, #20-28 was referred to the Superintendent: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-29 Motion by Vice Chair Bowman

Whereas: On January 6, 2021, our nation experienced an assault on democracy when the United States Capital was under siege by domestic terrorists that sought to stop the legitimate election of President-Elect Joseph Robinette Biden Jr. and Vice-President Elect Kamala Devi Harris through an insurrection directed by the forty-fifth president of the United States of America; and

Whereas: It has been reported, there were a significant number of individuals from the Commonwealth of Massachusetts that participated in the attack on the institution that upholds our democracy; and

Whereas: The events that transpired do not align with the values of the Cambridge Public School District and undermine the CPSD's mission of providing all students with rigorous, joyful, and culturally responsive learning as well as the social, emotional, and academic supports each student needs to achieve their goals and postsecondary success as engaged community members; and

Whereas: Under the guidance of the CPSD <u>SUSPENSION AND DISMISSAL OF PROFESSIONAL</u> <u>STAFF MEMBERS policy</u>, the Superintendent has authority to dismiss any employee in accordance with state law; and

Whereas: The behavior that transpired on this dark day in our nation's history set an unacceptable example for our children and anyone involved in the insurrection on January 6, 2021 should not be a part of CPSD; now therefore be it

Resolved: If any employee in CPSD was involved in events that transpired on January 6, 2021, the School Committee instructs the Superintendent to suspend and/or dismiss those individuals in accordance with CPSD policy with state law.

Discussion followed on #21-29.

Vice Chair Bowman felt this was important to bring up since there is evidence that citizens from Massachusetts participated in this act of sedition.

Member Rojas motioned an amendment to strike the word event and replace it with the word attack

Member Wilson motioned an amendment to insert the language and/or in future attacks.

On the amendments: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

On motion **#21-29** as amended: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-29 Motion by Vice Chair Bowman as amended:

Whereas: On January 6, 2021, our nation experienced an assault on democracy when the United States Capital was under siege by domestic terrorists that sought to stop the legitimate election of President-Elect Joseph Robinette Biden Jr. and Vice-President Elect Kamala Devi Harris through an insurrection directed by the forty-fifth president of the United States of America; and

Whereas: It has been reported, there were a significant number of individuals from the Commonwealth of Massachusetts that participated in the attack on the institution that upholds our democracy; and

Whereas: The events that transpired do not align with the values of the Cambridge Public School District and undermine the CPSD's mission of providing all students with rigorous, joyful, and culturally responsive learning as well as the social, emotional, and academic supports each student needs to achieve their goals and postsecondary success as engaged community members; and

Whereas: Under the guidance of the CPSD <u>SUSPENSION AND DISMISSAL OF PROFESSIONAL</u> <u>STAFF MEMBERS policy</u>, the Superintendent has authority to dismiss any employee in accordance with state law; and

Whereas: The behavior that transpired on this dark day in our nation's history set an unacceptable example for our children and anyone involved in the insurrection on January 6, 2021 should not be a part of CPSD; now therefore be it

Resolved: If any employee in CPSD was involved in events attacks that transpired on January 6, 2021 and/or in future attacks, the School Committee instructs the Superintendent to suspend and/or dismiss those individuals in accordance with CPSD policy with state law.

On a motion by Member Fantini, seconded by Member Rojas, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote on item #21-19: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel NAY; Member Weinstein NAY; Member Wilson NAY; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

Members asked for a point of clarification as to what the upcoming vote actually means. It was explained that a **YEA** vote means you **will allow reconsideration** within the 48-hour deadline. A **NAY** vote means there is **no opportunity for reconsideration**.

The Rules having been suspended for the purpose stated, a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, failed of adoption: Member Rojas NAY; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman NAY; Member Fantini NAY; Mayor Siddiqui NAY. The vote was finalized with four negatives votes; item #21-19 will not come back before the Committee of the Whole.

The meeting returned to the regular order of business.

On a motion by Mayor Siddiqui, seconded by Member Rojas, on the following roll call vote, all three Reports #21-30, #21-31 and #21-32 were accepted as presented: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

#21-30 That the Report of the School Climate Sub-Committee on August 25, 2020 be accepted as presented:

Virtual School Climate Sub-Committee Report Tuesday, August 25th, 2020 Broadcast from the Media Arts Studio 454 Broadway, Cambridge, MA

Called for the purpose of discussing emergent proposals and plans for supporting CPSD scholars' social, emotional and mental health in the 2020-21 school year. It is anticipated that this meeting will end no later than 6:30 pm.

Members Present: Member Rachel, Member Wilson, Vice Chair Bowman

Also Present: Member Vera-Degraff, Member Killian, State Representative Marjorie Decker, Chandra Banks, Alice Cohen

The meeting started at 5:00 pm. Member Rachel is the chair and provided context and guidelines for the meeting. Member Rachel opened the meeting for scholars.

Hiba Eddaif noted that the administration needs to understand that there will be students who will feel more comfortable at home and students who are more comfortable in school and the importance to see how it plays out and then come together and be able to reassess.

Elijah Robinson discussed the importance of seeing students as individuals and of individualized support. Aroshi discussed the importance of healing spaces and the importance of staffing professional department and if there was a way that students could also have professional development to learn things like coping mechanisms.

Irene Hill talked about the possibility of using spaces in the schedule already such as advisory to talk about the mental health and provide resources for what they need mentally/emotionally.

Trevor Resnikoff from the Mental Health Advocacy Club discussed the importance of budget expansion in regards to CPS expanding their mental health services and the issues with the waiting lists. He advocated for more accessibility of services and training students as well as teachers (using CM to do this). Member Rachel turned the meeting over to Member Vera-Degraff, Member Killian, Maddie Yu-Phelps, Nicolena Capello for a presentation "Recommendations, Questions and Concerns" (Presentation). For the check-ins, they recommended ensuring that it's not just about academics, differentiating between students/families and just student check-ins. They emphasized the importance of these check-ins. Other

factors to keep in mind are: busy schedules for the scholars and families, that caregiver needs are met, clear communication, understanding that some scholars won't feel comfortable, culturally competency, and being cognizant of 504 plans and IEPS. They also discussed the importance of surveys and urged the CPS to gather more effective data from students. They had recommendations for professional development as well. They also touched upon the importance of accessibility to technology in creating a sense of safety. They also talked about communication, there should be anonymous methods of accessing resources for support, providing weekly updates. They furthermore put these into actionable steps: scholar check-ins, having the teachers record and to post the class online, weekly infographic sent out and moving towards data-informed practices.

Trevor Resnikoff reiterated the importance of flexibility in this plan and keeping in mind other students as well.

Hiba Eddaif provided an update from the Cambridge Youth Council that they are focusing on mental health and are trying to come up with a mechanism that students could anonymously share their thoughts and feelings during this time such as a forum or blog.

Member Rachel discussed how using different methods will be imperative during this time, one student could find the check-ins helpful while another could find the blog helpful.

Aroshi emphasized the importance of quantitative/qualitative data and procuring data from students we usually don't hear from. She discussed that past data has not been representative of the community as a whole and urged the administration to think about how to reach more people.

Maddie Yu-Phelps suggested having something for students to fill out during CM or advisory.

Vice Chair Bowman stated that the students should partner with the administration on the student survey, assisting them with the questions/structure and helping them look at the data. Vice Chair Bowman stated that it's important if we are not getting the information that we want, we have to change the tools we are using.

Member Rachel confirmed that the administration is working with the student task force on the School Climate Survey.

Member Rachel opened the meeting for care givers/community members for public comment.

Ashley Herring commended the scholars for their presentation and comments throughout the meeting. Mercedes Soto thanked the students as well. Mercedes wanted clarification on what the administration is doing to create a sense belonging, asked for updates about restorative practice methods.

Emie Michaud Weinstock urged the administration to be cognizant of racial trauma that the students are facing in their decision making progress. She discussed the school to prison pipeline, and how often the youth end up there because of insufficient amounts of mental health screenings from the very beginning. How is the administration addressing these issues in a remote-setting? She also wanted to know how we are engaging scholars in the new year and ensuring that we are being culturally sensitive to our approaches on mental health. She discussed the importance of our zoom practices as well, ensuring that are scholars are engaged/comfortable on zoom. She also asked who is going to be held accountable, and who is coordinating/managing these efforts.

Lisa Downing provided an update from the Special Education Parent's Advisory Council and that she has had parents come to her in crisis. She echoed Emie's sentiments about accountability and ensuring that there is follow up when families reach out.

State Representative Marjorie Decker who is the Chair of Committee on Mental Health, Substance Abuse and Recovery discussed a multitude of issues. She discussed how we need to reimagine how to address and support the needs of behavioral health amongst our children and youth. She commended the students for their presentation and urged the administration to look at their recommendations. She provided an update on the data and confirmed that there is rise of young people coming into the emergency room for mental health crises. There has been a sharp drop in calls for at DCF where they would receive calls about abuse, neglect and exploitation. There has also been a trend in higher rates of unemployment and that is having an intense impact on a family's sense of security and well-being. She offered her office as a resource for families who are experiencing these issues. She commented that the administration had missed the mark on implementing a hybrid version and whether students can thrive in front of a computer. Furthermore urged the school district to take responsibility for safely orchestrated socially distanced time with students and commended the check-ins but emphasized understanding that these check-ins need to be provided by other methods than just zoom to ensure student comfortability. She wants to make sure that Cambridge as a district, is reimagining an upstream of services and providing them so a student doesn't reach crisis level before they get the resources they need. The bill she is putting forward would require a mental health/behavioral screening through the school nurses

office. She urged Cambridge to be a model for other cities, and implement those screenings now also urged them to plan and think through what additional resources is the school going to need now. Discussed how Boston Public Schools has a dashboard that looks across the district at what the behavioral health needs of its students and supplements the gap by contracting out with organizations outside of the school to assist. She discussed how there are already not enough behavioral health and mental health services. She discussed how some of these things she is talking about are going to have to be mandated by the Superintendent. She also recommended that the School Department put together a COVID Task Force. She also urged people to follow the CRLS Mental Health Instagram and commended the curators of it.

Member Rachel discussed how they are not going to hear from administration at this meeting and this was to hear from scholars, educators and caregivers. Member Wilson and Vice Chair Bowman agreed to extend the meeting.

Chandra Banks provided an update about the increased level of mediators in the district. Furthermore discussed how they are using a model that has been proven effective from MIT. She also touched upon peer counseling which will include student compensation. She provided that mediation training has already started.

Alice Cohen discussed how she appreciated listening to the scholars.

Amara Donovan wanted to uplift the scholars and caregivers' voices. She expressed her concern over the use of some language by the School Committee such as higher surveillance of the students due to our youth of color already being over-policed/surveilled already, the idea of the confinement rooms for students that are thought to show symptoms which reminded her of solitary confinement. Also there needs to be a higher level of equity, and the needs of white students and those of color are not the same and need differentiated support. She wants this time to improve the education system in the long term. Nicolena Capello urged the administration to ensure that they are considering all students when they are talking about mental health support not just high schoolers and the importance of data to be taken and used and more accessible to students and caregivers.

Frank Barnes discussed the lack of equity in educational practices and urged Cambridge to be more culturally responsive and cognizant.

Jenny Chung brought up the issue of google meets and how no one can change their name which creates an issue for trans students and/or students who might have different identities.

Betsy Preval discussed the need to not be beholden to past practices or standards that are not culturally relevant and some of them are even inherently racist. She furthermore discussed that there needs to be a discussion on bringing arts back.

Member Rachel discussed the correlation between mental health and the arts.

State Representative Decker agreed on changing the language from "eyes on children." She furthermore discussed the mental health surge and if the district thinks that we can assess and meet those needs if kids are behind a computer all the time. She emphasized the importance of reimaging what it means to bring children/students and adults together. She discussed the work that Michael Monestime is doing with the Central Square Business Improvement District with Starlight Square. She discussed the importance of identifying open space near all of our elementary schools.

Nicolena Capello also discussed the arts and commented on how the administration support of the arts is not there.

Kini Udovicki thanked the students and echoed Betsy Preval's sentiments. Kini discussed the importance of the administration thinking about what materials the students will need throughout the year and provide them with that now and changing the curriculum to reflect student's lived experience and for the curriculum to be more imaginative. She advocated for a mid-week check-in instead of an end of the week one.

Janie Lupica thanked the students and expressed her hope that these SEL check-ins do not become just another administrative task.

Ena Valenzuela discussed the importance honoring the 504 and IEPS, the issue of time gap between students with mental health issues getting to a doctor. She urged the administration to ECA Riverside and Massachusetts advocates for children.

Emie Michaud Weinstock discussed next steps and that the proposals brought up in this meeting should be discussed further and she discussed the importance of transparency.

Member Rachel discussed how for next meeting the administration should share its plan for the checkins. Member Wilson agreed and mentioned that there will be public comment at the Superintendent's evaluation meeting and urged people to come speak. She further discussed the need to be solution oriented.

Kini Udovicki talked about potential effective strategies such as text messages to get more of the community involved in these meetings.

Member Rachel ended the meeting at 7:09 pm.

Respectfully submitted, Allison Daley Confidential Secretary to the School Committee Office

#21-31 That the Report of the Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee on September 10, 2020 be accepted as presented:

Virtual School Climate Sub-Committee Report Thursday, September 10th, 2020 Broadcast from the Media Arts Studio 454 Broadway, Cambridge, MA

Called for the purpose of discussing social emotional and mental health supports for CPSD Scholars for in the 2020-21 school year. This meeting will end by or before 8:00 pm.

Members Present: Member Rachel, Member Wilson

Also Present: Dr. Turk, Deputy Superintendent; Dr. Lyndsay Pinkus Brown, Chief Strategy Officer; Alice Cohen; Ayehsa Hurry; Jenny Flynn; Damon Smith, CRLS Principal; Principal Greber.

The meeting started at 6 pm. Member Rachel is the chair.

Member Rachel turned the meeting over to the administration for a <u>presentation</u>. Dr. Turk discussed how this past summer, some of the staff were able to participate in a webinar with Dr. Shaun King about a shift from trauma-informed care to healing centered engagement in particular for our students of color. The five characteristics he mentioned that every district should be thinking about are: belonging, joy, trust, connection and hope.

Alice Cohen was the first presenter and discussed the key ideas of social emotional and health supports. She emphasized that families and students don't need fixing and that the administration has to plan for inclusive and authentic reflection. Dr. Brown discussed foundational aspects of Healing Spaces. She also discussed how to make time for social emotional and mental health supports in the schedule. Dr. Turk discussed how every student will have a dedicated time for building connections, community and skills. Dr. Turk wants to include non-screen times for our students and reflected on lessons from the spring; smaller groups worked. Ayesha Hurry discussed the goals of SEL Competencies. Jenny Flynn discussed that the administration is adapting a model from Boston University for Health Education with the goal to increase protective factors and reduce risk through skill building, content acquisition and experiences. Dr. Turk touched upon building staff capacity to use trauma-informed and restorative practices. Alice Cohen discussed the expansion of social workers in CPS. She further talked about how kid's mental health in Cambridge, is a public health crisis. She discussed the gap between the services available and time

when the students get them. Ms. Bank further discussed building staff capacity to use restorative practices in training with staff, students and families. Ms. Banks discussed the importance of teacher self-care as well. Dr. Brown went through the structures to identify and provide differentiated support to students and families. Dr. Brown provided an update on the weekly check-in plan: starting the week of September 21, every student will receive a call. Dr. Brown also discussed how CPS was accepted into the State's SEL & Mental Health Academy.

Member Rachel opened the meeting for questions and comments.

Member Vera-Degraff asked for clarification about the check-ins. Principal Smith confirmed that for high schools, they will occur during advisory. Member Vera-Degraff asked if the group had any experience in facilitating restorative practices over zoom and if that would have an effect on the meetings. Ms. Banks discussed how empathy is not easily built through technology and noted that the responsibility is on the facilitators to keep students engaged and there will be increased training.

Member Vera-Degraff asked about what questions will be on the survey and when will it be sent out. Dr. Brown provided context about the survey and confirmed it will be sent out in November.

Member Killian asked for clarification on the check-ins, in the beginning, there was discussion on allowing scholars to choose who their mental health support person would be. Principal Smith explained at the high school level there would be parent check-in/student check-in, family listening conferences but they weren't able add the student choice piece into it yet. Member Killian noted that she received a check-in. Tony Clark asked if they are using the check-ins to track academic progress. Principal Smith responded that the initial conversation the emphasis is on the overall well-being of the student and that they are trying to build communication structures to provide support. Alice Cohen noted the unprecedented circumstances of the time we are in and discussed how it takes time to build communities and how children are more fragile and vulnerable than they were six months ago. Dr. Brown noted that we have to be thoughtful about working with educators to solicit feedback on what is working and what is not working.

Emie Michaud Weinstock commented that the word trust is imperative to the work and asked for clarification on professional development in regards to anti-racist SEL practices. Ms. Banks confirmed trust is a huge component of restorative practices.

Tyrone Bellitti asked for clarification on what happens if the student and adult aren't a good match and ongoing training for the people doing the check-ins. Dr. Brown clarified the guidelines about matching and that some people did matching in the spring so they are not starting from scratch in the fall. She noted the need for reflection with students and staff on check-ins. Principal Smith provided context for the high-school match process and clarified that Wednesday is dedicated time for professional development.

Mercedes Soto asked for professional development support if it is going to be differentiated depending on who they are working and the need to think about the different needs of different populations. Dr. Turk stated any professional learning they are thinking about these factors and that they continue to share new knowledge and expertise that is lined with administration's goals and expectations around being an antiracist district.

Daniel reiterated Mercedes Soto's sentiments and the importance of differentiated support. He discussed disappointment in the timeline of these changes and the importance of the communication aspect of social emotional learning and that some families who have not had experience in mental/social emotional health as in issue may not be able to make this pivot as quickly.

Nancy Tauber discussed the importance of the administration to connect students and families with resources.

Eliza asked about how our most vulnerable students are being included in this conversation especially in regards to check-ins. Dr. Brown discussed about how there have been significant conversations ensuring that students in Special Education Programs are not left out of this and the complex process of determining the educator's caseload.

Betsy Preval discussed several issues and spoke to her experience as an educator during this time and their overwhelming schedules. She emphasized the need for the administration to understand that teachers are very overwhelmed and the feelings about adding the check-ins to their already busy schedules.

Member Rachel commented that the district needs to do more to support educator well-being. Member Rachel will follow up on what can be done to help the adults. Member Rachel extended the meeting.

Vice Chair Bowman discussed the level of pressure that the system is under and there needs to be a conversation of priorities. Vice Chair Bowman asked for clarification on whether or not there is a mechanism for families to opt-out of these check-ins. Dr. Brown confirmed that here is an opt-out option.

Vice Chair Bowman further discussed the need for the district to understand that some people only see and understand school through an academic lens and the significance of how we are rolling this out. She noted that the check-ins are a significant ask for our educators.

Member Wilson emphasized the need to take care of our educators and that trust is a big component of building relationships. She asked for clarification on what staff will be doing the check-ins? Dr. Brown discussed how the check-ins are all staff. Principal Smith confirmed that currently they have not included safety personnel, food services or clerks. Member Wilson noted her want to integrate clerks into check-in calls.

Member Weinstein echoed the need to make sure the district is making a robust effort to care for everyone in our community. Member Rachel discussed the intent of the check-in was relationship building. Member Rachel discussed the motions going forward to take more of employee support such as the moratorium of MCAS and there should be a redouble efforts to support the team.

Member Rachel asked about the opportunities for staff to check on student's in-person, an update about what office will be coordinating this effort (the intent was to be for it to go through the Office of Equity, Inclusion and belonging but they are not open yet), and an update about the integration of the arts. Dr. Turk provided an update about the coordination and they are on target for check-in in the beginning of the school year. Dr. Turk will be coordinating student outreach efforts. Dr. Brown agreed with the significance of getting arts implemented and the efforts in regards about using outdoor spaces.

Member Rachel talked about next steps: a conversation about the arts, updating the well-being of staff, and feedback from young people. Member Rachel extended the meeting to have a conversation about educator wellbeing.

Vice Chair Bowman discussed monitoring this policy in regards to caseload and feasibility. If we are telling our educators to do something and it's not being implemented because of capacity reasons and then more targeted and then scale at a different time. Member Rachel discussed how if educators are overwhelmed take other things off their plate. Vice Chair Bowman discussed how feasibility is a conversation that needs to happen.

Member Wilson echoed the need to talk about the arts and the capacity of our educators. She discussed the importance of transparency and while the intent was admirable, there have been implementation issues. The roll out is losing the spirit of the intent and the importance of educator feedback in adapting the policy.

Principal Gerber discussed how her teachers are feeling similarly to what Betsy Preval expressed. She is worried about the impact that this check-in would have on educators.

Dan Monahan echoed Betsy Preval's sentiments. He discussed the disconnect happening from the intention of these proposals and how some of them are unrealistic. He discussed what we could cut back and that we need to reflect on what we are promising and what we can pull off. He noted that because of the time spent on trying to do in-person learning, we have lost time to plan remote learning.

Member Wilson discussed the importance of prioritization and the need to listen to the people who are going to have to do that work.

Member Rachel discussed how she does not want social and emotional well-being to go and how can we balance these different factors.

Ms. Banks discussed how she is going to work with Dr. Brown and her group about this and reconvene with more strategies for this group. She believes there are enough resources in this district to figure out an effective plan. We need to upgrade our ability to solve these problems.

Mercedes Soto discussed how we can map our assets to make sure that we are meeting the needs of our community members.

Amatul Mahmud discussed how the educators are struggling and talked about her own experience as an educator during this time. She believes there needs to be better communication between the administration and the educators.

Liz Hill discussed the importance of looking at the interconnectedness of SEL and academics.

Member Rachel discussed the importance of educator well-being and how we should move forward. Member Wilson talked about ways they could get feedback: a town hall, a survey and how to be able to assess what educator capacity would be. Member Rachel discussed going building by building. Dan Monahan recommended systemically and clarify the expectations on the schedules. Daniel talked about how what the School Committee could do for educators on the policy level through mandate clarity. There needs to be an integrated voice in soliciting voices for feedback and that the intentions are being received equitably by families. Dr. Turk did not recommend a survey and noted that people want to be heard in real-time.

Member Rachel ended the meeting at 8:30 pm.

Respectfully submitted, Allison Daley Confidential Secretary to the School Committee Office

#21-32 That the Report of the School Committee Sub-Committee on December 2, 2020 be accepted as presented:

Virtual School Climate Sub-Committee Report Wednesday, December 2, 2020 Broadcast from the Media Arts Studio 454 Broadway, Cambridge, MA

Called for the purpose of discussing revisions to the elementary school check-in policy. It is anticipated that this meeting will last no later than 6:30 p.m.

Members Present: Member Rachel, Chair; Member Wilson

Also present: Mayor Siddiqui; Member Weinstein; Member Vera-Degraff; Dr. Turk; Ena Valenzuela, Working Group Member; Dr. Lyndsay Pinkus Brown; Cambria Russell; Mary DeWitte, 4th Grade Teacher; Jo Quest-Neubert; Suzanne Russell; Alice Cohen, Lead Teacher for Social Emotional Learning; Principal Gerber; Tony Clark; Amatul Mahmud

The meeting started at 5 pm. Member Rachel the Chair. Member Rachel started with a <u>presentation</u> and provided background on the check-in policy. She commented that the lack of relationships is a key barrier to racial equity in our schools. She provided further context that the School Committee passed a policy in June for individual relationship-building weekly check-ins between school staff and scholars/families and that COVID provided an opportunity to change how we are doing things in school. She provided further information on the implementation of the weekly check-ins. Member Rachel discussed the number of concerns from the principals about the check-ins: the check-ins are not sustainable and possibly not

needed for every child. Member Rachel followed up that there has been some success in elementary school check-ins at the Tobin and that issues with staffing have made check-ins very difficult.

Then Member Rachel went through alternative approaches to the weekly check-ins. Dr. Brown provided more context on the alternative approaches. They have eliminated the School Committee check-in all together.

Member Rachel opened the meeting for discussion.

Member Vera-Degraff discussed how the weekly check-ins have been working in high schools better due to the established relationships.

Cambria Russell asked if the administration was hearing from the family and students if there have been benefits from this weekly check-in. Member Rachel noted that it was her impression that most elementary schools have not implemented this because they felt like it was too much. Principal Gerber confirmed that some schools have not started and that there is evidence that families are feeling overwhelmed by the amount of adults from the school trying to contact them about other things. Some schools have tried it in smaller cohorts rather than the whole school. No parent feedback is available.

Ena Valenzuela asked what they intend to do for 9th graders in regards to the check-ins and noted the difficulty of not having established relationships and how they are addressing kids with the highest needs. Member Rachel commented that the every high schooler should have gotten a call. Member Vera-Degraff commented that the goal is to have every high schooler contacted in a weekly or bi-weekly fashion but some teachers have not been able to do it due to time constraints. Ms. Valenzuela asked for further clarification on what the flags were for teachers to check-in with students. Member Rachel discussed how every student was supposed to get a call but because our educators are stretched so thin that it wasn't feasible, now they are trying to figure out who we should be focusing on.

Mary DeWitte, an educator, advocated for looking at <u>Alternative B</u>. She prioritizes on a daily basis on who she is making the calls to. She believes that who is doing the outreach is important and that if someone else is going to make the call, it's important to share what they learned to reach a conclusion and get the student what they need. Also she noted it was important to the teacher on who is making the calls and that while she agrees with the genesis of the check-ins, bringing teachers in earlier would have the implementation more effective. Member Rachel discussed how going forward they would include educators in the beginning.

Jo Quest-Neubert, discussed how remote learning has actually increased access to teachers to some parents. They discussed their own positive relationship with their kids' remote learning experience. They appreciate the intention of the check-in policy, recognized the difficulty in prioritizing what students need to be reached out to and how to measure that. Member Rachel agreed that there is an assumption that remote learners are not getting the same experience as in-person learners. The fact that are three different models occurring: teachers only during in-learning, teachers doing remote and in-person learning, and teachers only doing remote needs to be considered. Member Rachel concurred. Member Rachel discussed how there has been talk about the effects of remote learners not having their cameras on and how it's harder for the teacher to tell how they are doing.

Suzanne Russell, a remote teacher, provided context about parent access level to teachers. She noted that before remote learning, factors such as whether or not parents dropped their students off or the student took the bus effected teacher access. She commented how remote learning has amplified teacher/parent contact. She then discussed the issues with the Aspen reporting form and that the form does not allow documentation of issues such as food insecurity. She iterated the importance of authentic relationships. Member Rachel discussed the elimination of the reporting.

Mary DeWitte discussed how going forward, we shouldn't generalize check-ins to groups such as remote learners and in-learners, and it should be more individually-based.

Alice Cohen advocated for a more clinical approach and to be more therapeutic for our families. Alice discussed how teacher's current schedules are not sustainable. She commented on how there are students who are doing well right now and discussed the importance of consistent-messaging of policies.

Suzanne Russell wanted to discuss the remote policy. Member Rachel discussed how the remote policy is an equity issue and a community issue, the recommendation of this meeting will be about check-ins but that is an important issue for the Committee to take up.

Principal Gerber commended the educators and thanked Member Rachel for listening and her flexibility. She further commented that the spirit of the check-in policy was the meaningful relationships that are built with caregivers. Now the conversation needs to shift around what children are seen in classrooms and why or why not and the ways in which educators build relationships in person compared to online and the effectiveness.

Cambria Russell asked what support do teachers need to bolster this work. Member Rachel discussed how that was touched upon at the last hearing. Mary discussed how having an Aide or another teacher assisting her would have been very beneficial and staffing is a huge issue. Also suggested that things that aren't relevant right now need to be taken away such as MCAS.

Amatul Mahmud discussed her concern about the students having to worry about assessments. There should be less "red tape" in regards to serious interventions that students might need.

Alice Cohen brought up that the pandemic has amplified problems that were already here. She discussed the need for a more macro-social work perspective and talked about the support group for teachers.

Jo Quest-Neubert reiterated the needs for aides and noted that teachers spend a lot of time doing tech support. They further discussed in-person learners are getting a lot more resources. Advocated for tech support paras.

Emie Michaud Weinstock discussed how educators are being stretched thin, touched upon staffing issues and overall how to improve remote learning. She asked about what the City of Cambridge is doing to support Cambridge Public Schools.

Jenny Chung talked about the collaboration aspect of teaching and advocated for more administration support to achieve this.

Tony Clark discussed how there should be a consideration for high schoolers who have younger siblings and the effect that has had during this time. The salient themes that he has been hearing have been frustration and that they feel like they have to manage their younger sibling's education.

Suzanne Russell made a final point that all elementary schools should have additional staff to support students.

Member Rachel opened the meeting for members of the administration.

Dr. Turk touched upon the staffing issues and going forward that the administration will look how staff is being utilized instead of just adding more staff for a first step. She emphasized the need for flexibility and the importance of relationships for the elementary school check-ins.

Member Rachel opened the meeting for other Members.

Member Weinstein commented on how the interconnectedness of the issues that were brought up during this meeting, the roundtable hearing happening next Tuesday. He is also going to schedule a Curriculum and Achievement Sub-Committee to follow up and have a robust conversation about reviewing what remote learning has been and what it will be going forward.

Mayor Siddiqui discussed how the Mayor's Office reached out to the Cambridge Public Libraries and together they have been able to provide books for remote learners. She discussed how there are things her office can do in the interim to help and the importance of people reaching out to get needs met.

Member Wilson emphasized the work that the educators have been doing and expressed her thanks. She discussed the fact that more resources went into in-school learning. She discussed how the intent of the check-in motion was about relationship building. Member Wilson also noted that it's important that educators need to continue to voice what they need.

Member Rachel discussed the tension between these calls being clinical and building trust with the families. Member Rachel noted that the recommendation coming out of this committee will be the tiered approach during the pandemic then to bring everyone back to the table when there is more bandwidth and evaluate what worked and didn't. Member Rachel discussed the idea of having an educator and school based administrator for each Sub-Committee.

Member Rachel asked Member Wilson about her opinion on the tiered approach. Member Wilson agreed with the tiered approach.

Member Rachel asked the educators their opinion on how they should evaluate the effectiveness of the check-ins at the end of the year. Principal Gerber suggested conversations with teachers.

Alice Cohen discussed the model that is being implemented at some of the schools using a social worker and three parents paras for emotional supporters and that reduced calls to the office for help by 80%.

Cambria Russell discussed how her organization the Massachusetts Statewide Family Engagement Center has "Mindful Mondays" open to educators, trying to create a space for educators to come and have a moment of self-care.

Member Wilson discussed some conversations she has with students and how she emphasized the need for the empathy with the educators.

Member Rachel thanked the participants of the meeting and ended the meeting at 6:49 pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Allison Daley
Confidential Secretary to the School Committee Office

10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence):

11. Announcements:

Student Member Vera-Degraff announced that starting tomorrow as part of the Winter Arts Festival there will be a Winter Vocal Concert at 6:00 p.m. featuring pre-recorded and live performances of CRLS students.

Member Wilson announced that the 5th annual CRLS scholarships with Community Partners opened today. The portals have opened today and will be open every Thursday until February 25, 2021 from 3-4 p.m. for workshops that offer over 100 scholarships for our seniors to apply for.

Member Fantini announced that his family has been offering a scholarship over the past 20 years to Bentley College and if anyone is interested, please contact him.

Member Rojas wants the community to know that the Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee will be meeting next Monday at 5:00 p.m.

Member Wilson announced that Special Education and Students Supports Sub-Committee will meet this Thursday, 3:3-5:00 p.m. on the re-opening plan for OSS students.

Member Fantini announced that he will bring in a Resolution for the passing of Ms. Carol Correia at the next meeting.

12. Late Orders: None

13. Communications from City Officers: None

Distributed Back-up Documents (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- Regular Meeting Agenda
- Second Semester Plan PowerPoint Presentation

Statements from Public Comment (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- Rachael Dorr, supports delay in the reopening of schools until educators concerns are addressed
- Sue Butler, asks that CPSD not open schools
- Jeffrey Huggins, supports expanded in-person learning
- Tim Logan, supports expanded in-person learning
- Kate Skubecz, supports the reopening plan
- Michele Fry, opposed to opening schools
- Daniel Emie Michaud Weinstock, supports power share with students, families and EOCC
- Catherine Zusy, very sorry that Superintendent Salim has resigned
- Bridgette Sheridan, supports reopening plan on March 1st
- · Kris Kickson, Thanks the School Committee for listening sessions and hard work
- Elinor Actipis, supports #21-19, #21-27, opposed to motion #21-29
- · Heidi Samojkuk, supports in person learning
- Briney Burley, supports in person learning
- Jennifer Mason Stott, questions whether scientific advisor advice is updated
- Susan Butler, opposed to opening schools at this time

E-Mail communications:

- ✓ Duncan MacLaury, demands apology from Vice Chair Bowman for comments
- ✓ Monica Bueno, supports reopening plan and Motion #21-27
- ✓ Susana Domingo, supports reopening plan and Motion #21-27
- ✓ Heather Hewitt, opposed to opening schools at this time
- ✓ Jacquelyn Smith, supports opening schools for parents that desire it
- ✓ Virginia Best, supports reopening schools asap

On a motion by Member Fantini, seconded by Member Rachel, it was voted, on a roll call vote, to adjourn the open session: Member Rojas YEA; Member Rachel YEA; Member Weinstein YEA; Member Wilson YEA; Vice Chair Bowman YEA; Member Fantini YEA; Mayor Siddiqui YEA.

Adjourned (11:45 p.m.).

Doshu E. Beard

Attest:

Dosha Beard Executive Secretary to the School Committee