

**C A M B R I D G E
S C H O O L C O M M I T T E E**

(Official Minutes)

Regular Meeting

March 19, 2019

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan,
Mayor McGovern

Also Present: Mr. Grassi, Mr. Escallon, Student School Committee Representatives (both ABSENT)

Mayor McGovern in the Chair

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. He also explained that there are three consecutive meetings happening tonight. First we will have a Public Hearing on the FY 20 Budget, to be chaired by Budget Co-Chair, Committee Member Dexter, followed by the Regular Meeting. The third meeting will be a Budget Workshop and although the public is welcome to stay, there will not be public comment and no votes will be taken. The chair was turned over to Committee Member Dexter.

Committee Member Dexter read a statement from the two School Committee representatives explaining their absence tonight.

1. *Public Hearing on the FY 20 Budget

The following individuals were heard:

- Karen Engels, Wendell Street, re budget, in support of More Hearts and Hands, especially Paraprofessionals. She gave examples of how important it is to have another adult with the teacher at all times.
- Dan Monahan, Lexington Ave, CEA President, in support of the Superintendent's FY20 Proposed Budget, he passed out a chart and explained it along the way. Staffing equity is going well, however, racial equity is still not being addressed. \$50,000.00 is not enough to make changes happen with the Nellie Mae Grant, a structure needs to be put in place to erase the root causes of inequity.
- Caitlin O'Donnell, Goldstar Rd., PAC, Political Action Committee, in regards to staffing, she is thankful for Ms. Maryanne MacDonald, and that the elementary Principals listened to their requests. The teachers need more help in the classrooms. The position of their Autism Inclusion Specialist of twelve years has been eliminated and replaced with a General Inclusion Specialist, and they will still have fewer Paraprofessionals than at the Montessori. They are submitting an initial proposal from the PAC for the School Committee's consideration.
- Courtney Foley, Dorchester Ave., Boston, Budget, staffing at the FMA, wants to know what data is being used to decide what the resources are for schools. She is not happy with the restructuring of the inclusion program without input with anyone at the school that will be affected.
- Katie Lynch, David's Island Rd, Weymouth, re budget, she is here to advocate for language based learning disabilities program at Graham & Parks, where there is a proposal to reduce one of the teachers for next year. The needs of these students are significantly high and it is crucial for these students to have as much as support as they are used to in their sub-separate classes, they cannot do well with less.

- Madeline Rosenberg, representing the School Council at K-Lo, is requesting additional funds for the three first grade classes. That cohort will need at least one more second grade class to accommodate the large first grade cohort. There is a fairly high turnover in the school due to parents moving to Cambridge temporarily while on sabbaticals; it makes it hard for the teachers to adapt to the needs of students. Unfortunately, the plan for the incoming year is that there are going to be less for what is already not enough.
- Carrie Jung, Standish St., is presenting a petition from the K-Lo from the rising second grade class for additional supports. They feed double what all other schools feed from the weekend backpack program. They want a third classroom with a Paraprofessional for the second grade classes. (Statement on file in the School Committee office).
- Anil Mundra, Plympton St., is thankful for creating more classrooms for OLA, it is unique and hard to find anywhere else. It is not fair to create a system wherein class size dwindles in the upper grades. CPS has a huge budget, they are asking for only one more Portuguese immersion class now.
- Fabriane Novohna, River Street, Budget, hoping for more in the OLA program. They were told if their numbers increased, they would have a second kindergarten. Now the district has found other reasons to not hold up to their word. This is the reason why we have an issue of trust with the district. Please give them one more second kindergarten class next year.
- Bev Seidenberg, Griswold Street, Special Start, re budget, is hoping CPS will consider the following needs of the students with rare genetic disorders, there are a lot of multi unit homes occupied by families with small children; please understand their current situation of having a single classroom located all around the city is not good. In order to serve their communities to the fullest, they are asking for a minimum of two classrooms per school building.
- Moira McNabb, Waltham St., Newton, Special Start pre school teacher, they need a Psychologist and an Inclusion Specialist, concerned to hear that a position is going to a consult model instead of having a trained Inclusion Specialist staff that do more than provide PowerPoint presentations, they are in the classrooms working with the teachers.
- Janet Forte, Appleton St., Arlington, Special Start, the Inclusion Specialist being proposed as well as a Psychologist is helpful and she is thankful. They have been around for over 30 years, they need a clear vision for their program. More time and planning needs to be put into where the classrooms are being placed. They are lucky, but that is not the case for many of their colleagues. They do not all get the same consideration and value for materials in the budget.
- Kris Dickson, Fresh Pond Pkway, she is thankful for the 59 new additions that are distributed in terms of equity. She is also thankful for the busing for the elementary schools field trips.
- Angel Stewart, parent, Cambridge St., from her heart, spoke for children that have been labeled as disabled, she is asking for the School Committee to make sure that they provide the accommodations and services needed for these children and teachers also. The teachers have needs too. Having an education is a weapon, sometimes the teachers are the only positive impact a disabled child has. She appreciates her teachers – they inspire and help kids.
- Irene Kang, Hurley St, OLA program. It is important for east Cambridge, it is a practical use of resources, she's hoping that it will last for her son to get to 5th grade. She grew up during a time when bilingualism was not valued. They need the second kindergarten classroom in order to get more people.
- Kelly Dolan, Upland Rd., budget, she is hoping that the elementary grades can have more classrooms, and there really needs to be more equity. The teachers have been asking for more staff in the classroom with them.
- Jen Richards, Aberdeen Ct., Budget, she is disappointed that there is nothing about co-teaching at the elementary level,. We start new programs and curriculums every year without giving the teachers enough time to flesh out the newness and see if it works. Why are we failing to close the achievement gap? Why are students of color still failing when we have so much money to spend on each student? The answer is that we are not putting enough money in the classrooms for the kids that need it the most.
- Laura Holson, Thorndike Street, OLA, she is requesting funds for the OLA program, there are smaller class sizes in the upper grades, please put in another kindergarten. They need more time and need to plan more. The verbal confirmation will be delayed to the budget for 2021. They need it now. It would reduce inequity in the World Language Program.

- Sarah Figge Hussen, Valentine Street, Budget/Staffing, she thought the norm was to have two adults in all classrooms, she was very surprised to find that it is not the norm. It should be. There are also student teachers that want to teach, they could be brought in too. Full time Paraprofessionals are wonderful, but it doesn't mean that is the only option.
- Tara Edelschick, Valentine Street, she believes what Mr. Kimbrough said is true, the system is working exactly the way it is supposed to be. We will have to change the centuries old system that has been going on in our schools from the beginning. It might mean blowing the whole thing up, but if not here are a few choices: Insisting on teaching Honors to all students. The rich do not get all that they ask for. Teachers don't get tenure if they cannot close the achievement gap.
- Tina Lieu, Huron Ave, in support of the teachers union, she loves the Paraprofessionals, you loose at both ends if the teacher doesn't have the time to give differentiated instruction. You cannot provide a consult for a kid you do not know. She did not know about the elimination of the Autism Inclusion Specialist. She has been working on the Committee for Educators of Color, it seems that if we want to retain them, we need to make sure they have allies.
- Robson Goulart, Gore St, OLA, his son is bicultural and when he takes him to Brazil, they cannot believe he is not a native Brazilian. He pays an arm and a leg for rent here in Cambridge, but it is worth it for his being in OLA, he is troubled by there not being a 2nd kindergarten class. There is a high demand for it.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Bowman, it was voted to close the Public Hearing on the FY 20 Budget. Vice Chair Kelly in the Chair

The Chair declared a 5 minute recess. The time for recess having expired, the Chair reconvened the meeting. Mr. Fantini moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan to suspend the Rules to bring the Superintendent's Presentation on "the Mind Matters: Families Make a Difference forward. It was voted, on a voice vote, to suspend the Rules for the reason stated.

7b. CPS District Plan:

Strategic Initiative 4.1: Engaging Families as Partners.....Maryann MacDonald,
Asst. Supt. for Elementary Education
Melody Brazo,
Welcoming Schools Coordinator
CPS Family Liaison Representatives

The presentation began with Dr. Salim giving an overview of what will be shared tonight as part of the Engaging Families as Partners by focusing on Mind Matters. He introduced the presenters:

Ms. MacDonald, Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education; Ms. Melody Brazo, Welcoming Schools Coordinator; Ms. Mary Grassi, Title I Coordinator; Ms. Lillian Rater, Amigos Family Liaison; and Ms. Lissa Galluccio, Haggerty Family Liaison.

Ms. Maryanne MacDonald explained what Mind Matters is. It is a 20 hour course for the parents, liaisons and our city partners. It helps them understand the research on brain development. This partnership is in its third year. The team is going to talk about the current content, feedback from families, lessons learned and plans for the future.

Ms. Brazo took over and spoke about the Course for parents/caregivers, there is free food and childcare at each session. They also provide free books, games and activities that families can do at home. It begins with what families already know about their kids. It also covers current research on childhood brain development, and most importantly, it builds the social-emotional, executive function and intellectual skills of children ages 4-8 years old. They get a good mix of families.

Ms. Grassi gave a history of the program. They have had great success in recruiting families. Every session is led by two liaisons, there are 69 families that are currently in the program. They have 24 trained presenters – that are trained at Harvard. When the next session happens, there is always a

review of the previous session. They are trying to be more inclusive of the families by recruiting families from all over the city

Ms. Galluccio spoke on the feedback from families. She spoke on home experiences and she also named a list of activities that are free.

Ms. Rater commented that she teaches in Spanish. Most parents talked about how they usually only have time to yell and give directives to their kids, but this course gives the parents the opportunity to tell their kids how they feel about them. The families want this course to be extended to the high school. They are helping their children learn how to focus better, take on challenges and be more assertive. We take a lot of this for granted, but in reality, we cannot close the achievement gap without getting closer to the families. This creates a real community of learners, and culturally responsive teaching.

Ms. Rater spoke on the task and burden of parenting, and some parents have stated that they would like to take the class again.

Ms. Brazo, spoke on future plans. They are formally putting it in the budget. They are sharing costs with Harvard University and they plan to continue it in both Spanish and English versions. A lot of this did not come in Spanish. Ms. Rater and Ms. Lucy Hernandez had to translate it first and then teach it. That was a huge plus.

The presentation ended and the floor was opened for questions.

Mr. Kimbrough thanked them for the presentation. He wonders about brain development with boys, in particular how single moms can support their boys in their learning.

Ms. Rater stated there sections in the back of every module called second steps which is a curriculum that provides different tools to help kids and is general for both, it does not target any gender.

Ms. Brazo added that socialization is different for boys and girls; the brain development is the same for both genders.

Committee Member Dexter stated it sounds like a great program, she wonders if there is an advocacy section that teaches parents to advocate for their kids.

Ms. Galluccio answered that there is a safe place to learn those skills.

Mr. Fantini liked the presentation and stated that less it better, this was something to celebrate. He likes the way they have embraced it. He asked if it possible for the participants to get credits from Harvard.

Ms. Rater said they get a certificate but not any credits.

Ms. Grassi stated that Boston has a partnership for credits in their section. Watertown also does this same course.

Mr. Fantini also asked if Baby University parents are connected to this. The answer is that Baby University parents are taking this course.

Vice Chair Kelly appreciates the concept of safe space. It illustrates how we can reach diverse families and help them feel connected to each other and the schools. It is a powerful model and there is really deep family engagement going on in this course.

Ms. Nolan opened with her problem which is too bad it wasn't around when her kids were around when her kids were in the system, she could have benefitted. Which brings her to capacity, what happens when families cannot get into it? Do the plans include working with parents that cannot get in?

Ms. Brazo stated that they have not figured that out yet. When all of the cohorts are done, they will sit down with all of the facilitators. They have the capacity to do more, but they are not sure how to do it yet.

Ms. MacDonald stated that there are staff members working all over the district trying to build our own train the teacher model system. She is giving a shout out to the family liaisons for planning courses over the weekends to make sure all possibilities are explored.

Ms. Bowman asked if all communities are being included in this work.

Ms. Brazo responded that yes, it definitely is a factor, when they do Mind Matters. Twenty hours of face time with families builds a strong relationship and changes everything. Trust flows from one family to another across the district.

Ms. Bowman asked if there is a way to create a standardized way to make it happen in the whole world of Cambridge. Ms. MacDonald explained what goes on everywhere. She added at the end that she needs to sign up because the yelling is started to escalate.

Mayor McGovern in the Chair

1a. Public Comment

There being no one signed up for Public Comment, public comment was passed over.

2. Student School Committee Report:

Mr. Escallon is attending the Vigil at City Hall

Mr. Grassi is home sick tonight

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Bowman, it was voted to accept the minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 5, 2019 as presented.

4. Reconsiderations: None

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar: None

6. Awaiting Reports:

#19-39, that whereas Cambridge Public Schools values a collaborative relationship between CPS schools and Cambridge's Out of School Time (OST) Programs in order to ensure continuous and appropriate learning throughout the day for the many CPS students attending afterschool programs; and Whereas the different ending times of CPS schools makes quality programming difficult for afterschool programs, resulting in lost OST learning opportunities for students;

The School Committee requests that the administration provide an estimate of the added transportation costs if all CPS elementary schools ended at the same time, and if all CPS Upper Schools ended at the same time. This estimate is requested by March 19, 2019.

Mayor McGovern asked the Superintendent to speak publicly about motion **#19-39** so it can be placed on file.

The Superintendent explained that the estimate of the annual cost of standardizing start and end times is \$1.3 million. It should be noted that this cost estimate does not include changing start and end times for the two ELT schools at the King and Fletcher Maynard Academy. These costs are based upon current contract costs per route.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Dexter, Motion **#19-39** was placed on file.

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

7a. Presentations:

7c. Consent Agenda:

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to bring Superintendent's Agenda forward for discussion and adoption.

Mr. Fantini moved to adopt all items. On the following roll call vote, items **#19-47 through #19-49** were adopted: Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

#19-47, Special Needs Contracts for Day and Residential Program Services not Available from the Cambridge School Department, that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget and/or Grant Fund Budget.

	<u>#</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Day Program Tuition Contracts	0	
Residential Program Tuition Contracts	1	\$27,720.88
45 Day Program Contracts	<u>0</u>	
Total	1	<u>\$27,720.88</u>

#19-48, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for professional development, funds to be provided from the General Fund, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Shore Collaborative Collaboration, 100 Revere Beach Parkway, Chelsea, for the period September 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$25,000.00.

#19-49, Grant Award, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:

Federal Competitive Project/Grant SC19158, in the amount of \$17,948.00 for the period March 19, 2019 to August 31, 2019.

Description: This grant will be used to upgrade the serving line equipment at the Graham and Parks School. This equipment will support the school meal programs by allowing us to increase multicultural meal options, expand student engagement and selection, and showcase a better presentation of fruit and vegetable offerings that require appropriate temperature controls.

8. Non-Consent Agenda:

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):

Mr. Kimbrough moved, seconded by Vice Chair Kelly, to bring forward all items for discussion and adoption.

#19-50 Motion by Committee Member Dexter, that whereas the School Committee unanimously passed a motion on December 18, 2018, to hold a Roundtable on disproportionality in special education, to be held before June 1, 2019, the Committee requests that this roundtable be scheduled on April 9, April 23, May 28, or another suitable date before June 1, and that this date be determined by March 31, 2019.

A short discussion followed on **#19-50** and it was decided to have the Roundtable on May 28th.

#19-51 Joint Motion by Committee Member Dexter, Vice Chair Kelly, and Ms. Nolan, that whereas the Cambridge Rindge and Latin School administration has been engaged in a two-year process, supported by a School Committee Ad-Hoc Subcommittee, to revise the high school Attendance Violation (AV) Policy toward greater equity; and

Whereas the School Committee values data-informed policy-making and comprehensive communication of policies;

The School Committee requests that a draft of the new policy, to be implemented beginning in September, 2019, be presented, as a First Reading, to the School Committee no later than May 21, 2019, along with a communication plan to ensure that all students, faculty, and administrators are aware of the new policy and that there is faculty "buy-in"; and

The Committee requests data from the Fall, 2018, semester showing the following attendance data disaggregated by lunch status, race/ethnicity, gender, disability status, and ELL status: 1) number of students absent and tardy; 2) number of students absent and tardy without an excuse (Earned AV); 3) number of students "buying out" of their Earned AV's; and 4) number of students whose grades were reduced due to an Assigned AV. These data are requested by May 7, 2019.

Discussion followed on **#19-51**.

Ms. Dexter explained that the sub-committee concluded its work this past January, it was decided that Dr. Turk and Principal Smith along with the administration would bring forth a policy at the end of this school year that would be implemented in September. She has been under the impression that the draft policy would be before the Committee of the Whole on May 21, 2019 for discussion and adoption.

Ms. Nolan informed the Committee that this motion is not only to obtain data it is also to draft a new policy. The data is being tracked by the school.

Ms. Bowman asked what happened in the Sub-committee. The point was to work with the administration, and then bring a final recommendation back to the Committee of the whole.

Vice Chair Kelly stated that the process has not been adhered to in terms of bringing a recommendation to the Committee of the Whole, adding that she does not remember sunsetting this Ad Hoc Sub-Committee, which led to a discussion of whether or not the Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee actually was told to end (sunset).

Ms. Nolan stated that the Committee of the Whole sunsetted it. She is happy to reconstitute the sub-committee. It faded away since no one was watching out for it.

Ms. Bowman stated that when it was decided to sunset the sub-committee, she believed the ad hoc sub-committee would return to the Committee of the Whole with a recommendation from the Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee.

Ms. Dexter suggested that they reopen the Ad Hoc Sub-Committee.

The Mayor placed **#19-51** on the Calendar.

#19-52 Joint Motion by Ms. Nolan and Mr. Kimbrough, whereas the School Committee worked to raise the level of instruction for all students through the Level Up initiative at CRLS; and

Whereas a recent Globe project on valedictorians documented a sobering and critically important question of whether high schools are preparing students for success: and

Whereas the recent report The Opportunity Myth by The New Teachers Project found that despite 71% of students in a national representative sample of audited classes met classroom expectations and succeeded on assignments, only 17% of those assignments were on grade level when evaluated; and Whereas both the Valedictorian Project and The New Teachers Project identified the need for high expectations and intentional focus on rigorous curriculum, instruction and assignments as key to delivering on the promise of success in college and life; and

Whereas there were gaps by racial subgroups in performance on common assessment; and

Whereas nearly 1 in 3 CRLS students indicated that teachers do not have very high expectations of them; Therefore, the School Committee directs the Administration to have an external audit of the Level Up ELA classes, by an organization with expertise in this specific area, done in conjunction with the School Committee as a joint effort to ensure that the initiative is as successful as possible.

Discussion followed on **#19-52**.

Mr. Kimbrough stated that this motion is to ensure the work we give our students is at the appropriate grade level. The valedictorians are not able to graduate from college.

Ms. Nolan echoes the valedictorian report. The intent is to strengthen the program, not to question it. Many students that are told they can get help by having an external audit of Level UP ELA. If you are involved in the program, it is hard to step back and be objective and then evaluate it. They only want an outside perspective. This is part of continuous improvement. She wants to allay the un-trust issue.

Mr. Fantini asked if the Superintendent would normally make sure these programs would be reviewed anyway regardless of whether or not this motion passes. Mr. Fantini doesn't feel that this motion honors the work of the teachers.

The Superintendent stated that they do regular progress monitoring every Tuesday; there is already a regular process that is always used. There is tremendous power in doing this work continuously. He does not have any objectives to bringing outside assistance, he just wants to make sure we are using it in the ways that make the most sense. He does not believe an external audit is necessary at this moment. He would like to have an assessment first and then see if one is needed.

Committee Member Dexter supports the motion. She feels this can support the teachers and is not a criticism.

Ms. Bowman feels it is a high cost budget issue. This does not represent all communities. She would like to be completely sure the decision is one that will benefit all of our kids. Although she recognizes the benefit in having evaluations, she is not comfortable supporting this. Ms. Bowman questioned whether or not the School Committee is going to evaluate math in the middle schools?

Vice Chair Kelly is concerned also. The whole creation of the Level Up program was to build up equity. The community has encouraged us to create this program. Additionally we are getting an award for this program. We should be celebrating this program. That does not mean it is perfect, but we do not need to move forward with a motion that is not encouraging the Level Up program.

Mr. Kimbrough appreciates the comments of his colleagues and their different perspectives. He feels it is what makes this School Committee great. As a Guidance Counselor many of his students were not confident enough to go to college after taking the placement exams. They earned A's and B's in their courses and then find out they need to take remedial classes. The students felt lied to. They realized for the first time that they were not even close to being ready for college. We cannot continue to lie to our kids. He is fine to refer this to Dr. Salim.

Ms. Nolan reiterated that this is about supporting the program. There is money in the budget this year that can be directed to this with out changing anything else. She feels that the teachers want to know if they are being effective.

Dr. Salim wants to make it clear that his comments are whether or not this is the specific approach. When there is a partnership with an outside organization, it places a tremendous amount of work on everyone in the system. We need to try to keep our kids out of remedial classes. They have a partnership with Bunker Hill Community College; our assessments are aligned with BHCC. He also made mention of the fact that the valedictorian study in the newspaper was not completely academic. Acadamia is central, but there are other pieces to that piece of journalism which include family commitments, financial problems and non academic factors. The systemic inequities are large. Some of these kids are incredibly smart and talented and it makes it very hard.

Ms. Bowman emphasized that there may be money in this year's budget, but we are coming to a fiscal closure quickly. She does not see us being able to employ any outside contract before the end of the school year.

Mr. Kimbrough asked for a point of information from the Supt as to whether or not there is an exam offered to students after their sophomore year to take to ensure they are not on a track to need to take remedial classes after high school.

Superintendent stated that there are two different exams and he needs to check back with his staff to make sure some things he believes are actually accurate. It is his understanding that there is a test that is aligned to the non credit courses and there is another exam that is in alignment with the credited courses. Sophomore or Junior is the part that he needs to check on.

Mr. Kimbrough stated if the students are taking the test and performing well, great, there is no need for an outside audit. If they take a test after sophomore year that says differently, then there is a need for an outside audit. He recommends that we put something else in place like a report over the summer.

Mayor McGovern agrees that we always need to evaluate. He offered a motion to change the word audit to evaluate. Mayor McGovern also made note of the fact that "work be done in conjunction with the School Committee" is not the role of the School Committee. He is fine with referring this to the Supt. He feels the committee would like to see a report back on this issue in order to support the program.

Mr. Kimbrough would like to get specific clarity on when these exams are actually occurring. Is it sophomore year or junior year? Our first cohort is finishing up so this would be a good time to examine our results. He wants the report by the summer to see where our kids stand in order to take college level courses.

Mayor McGovern suggested having a Roundtable on a Level Up Report/Evaluation sometime in the fall to give the Supt. time to do the evaluation.

Ms. Nolan wants to address the timing; she feels that urgency is of the essence to do right by our kids.

The Chair asked the Superintendent what the Committee can expect to get back if it is referred to the Superintendent.

Superintendent Salim stated he is trying to give the flexibility to all of his various teams and move away from the narrow and directive nature of the motion to have an external audit of the program. He is trying to give the teams a chance to use their specific tools internally that will assess the level of rigor and alignment to readiness standards. The team, made up of district and school based administrators, meets on a weekly basis and are the people to make adjustments for improvement. This feels like the best approach.

Mr. Kimbrough is still ready to refer to the Superintendent to receive a report or data in the summer.

Ms. Bowman motioned, seconded by Vice Chair Kelly to refer to the Superintendent. The Mayor added that he bring a report to the August 6, 2019 summer meeting.

#19-53 Motion by Mr. Kimbrough, whereas the 2020 Budget had allocated funds to a boys mentoring program at CRLS; and

Whereas data from Qualls Academy shows that students in the program are making academic progress; Be it resolved that the Superintendent and Budget Office will explore adding Qualls Academy to the CambridgePort School and King Open School to create a triad of mentoring programs that feed into Cambridge Street Upper School.

Mr. Kimbrough motioned for permission to withdraw this motion. With unanimous consent, the withdrawal was accepted.

#19-54 Motion by Ms. Nolan, that whereas there have been recent concerns about a drop in immunizations for certain diseases; and
Whereas health experts advise that immunization rates of 95% or more are necessary to ensure collective resistance to preventable diseases and therefore safety for those who cannot be vaccinated for medical reasons; and
Whereas CPS may have some schools below the threshold of 95% vaccinated students;
That the School Committee requests a report from the school district on current vaccination rates; and
Further that the report include recommendations for how the district can work with families, perhaps with the city's public health experts to increase vaccination rates for all schools below a safe rate; and
Further that the district communicate to the state delegation to consider changes to the law to ensure only legitimate reasons for opting out of vaccinations are honored.

#19-55 Joint Motion by Ms. Bowman, Mayor McGovern and Ms. Nolan, whereas there has been an increase in the number of families declining immunization for their children across the country and in Massachusetts, and
Whereas there has been an outbreak of diseases once annihilated, which are causing public health emergencies in communities in other parts of the country, and
Whereas the CPSD is committed to ensuring the safety and public health of our students, and
Whereas most schools within the district have an immunization opt-out rate of 1.5% or lower, the Graham & Parks opt-out rate is at 10.0%, the highest in the district,
Therefore, be it resolved that the Administration work with the leadership of the Graham & Parks school to understand the root cause of this higher opt-out rate for vaccinations within the district and work with the CPSD community to emphasize the importance of immunizations for the safety of all CPSD students.

There was a short discussion on **#19-55**

It was noted that this motion was put on the agenda in error. The Mayor offered a substitute motion.

Whereas Cambridge Public School District is committed to ensuring the health, wellness, and safety of our students, and
Whereas vaccination throughout childhood is essential in providing immunity before children are exposed to potentially life-threatening diseases; and
Whereas the spread of disease is limited when a large percentage of the population is vaccinated; with public health officials reporting vaccination rates of up to 95% as necessary to provide a "herd immunity threshold," a collective resistance to preventable diseases; and
Whereas there is a documented decline in vaccinations for certain diseases across the country, including here in Massachusetts; and
Whereas other communities are experiencing the public health emergency of outbreaks of diseases once annihilated; now therefore be it resolved
That the School Committee requests a report from the Administration in collaboration with the Cambridge Health Department on current and accurate vaccination rates at each CPSD school facility; and further
That the Administration and Health Department work with the leadership of any school within the district that may have higher than average opt-out rate for vaccinations to understand the root cause of this occurrence and work with the community to emphasize the importance of immunizations for the safety of all in the CPSD community; and
Further that the district communicates with the state delegation to consider a request to explore ways to ensure that only valid legal exceptions allowing for an opt out of vaccinations are honored.

Ms. Nolan motioned to amend **heard** to **herd** on the 3rd whereas, last line. On a voice vote, the amendment was adopted. On a voice vote, **#19-55** as amended was adopted.

The Report of the February 26, 2019 Athletic Eligibility Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee was accepted as presented:

Athletic Eligibility Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee
February 26, 2019

Called for the purpose of discussing the new policy, to be rolled out in the Spring season.

Members Present: Ms. Nolan, Mr. Fantini

Also Present: Mr. Smith, Mr. Arria, Ms. Liss, Mr. Clark, Marc Levy, Mr. Galluccio, Mr. Childs

Student School Committee Members: Mr. Grassi, Mr. Escallon

In the absence of Mr. Kimbrough, the Chair, Mr. Fantini voted to elect a temporary Chair Ms. Nolan.

A quorum being present, Ms. Nolan called the meeting to order at 2:44 P.M. and read the call of the meeting.

Ms. Nolan gave a brief review of the MIAA eligibility which has not changed but probation for student on teams. More students will be able to get extra tutoring if their grade Ranges from 62.5 to 70.

Mr. Arria reiterated that in December the School Committee moved to change the academic grade from 67.5 to 70 for students to be able to continue to participate in sports. Tomorrow spring sports probationary number is going to be 60 as we check the eligibility range. It will be shared as we go thru the registration process. There are 60 students registered now until March 12. We will register approximately 500 kids but some will fall off. Sometime they can work toward eligibility that are on academic eligibility.

Ms. Nolan wants to clarify that the policy has been passed and will be put in place for the Spring season.

Mr. Arria stated that in December when it was passed the Winter season and the report cards were sent and students were advised of their eligibility. Anthony was going to share the information so kids know. At the end of 2nd quarter approximately four students fell between 60 and 67.5 for the Winter season sports.

Ms. Nolan asked what is the process to be sure supports are available to students. And how are they receiving notices and told what has to be done to participate?

Mr. Aria responded when students don't reach the academic probation standard grade of 70 which previously was 65 – 70 and now is 60 to 70. They are out of games for two weeks but are allowed to practice with the team and steered to the academic advisor, Mr. Saulnier. He seeks out students that are in that range, sends email and reaches out to Coaches so students can attend study halls which are 2-3 times per week. He has worked with teachers to be sure students know what work is required to participate in athletics. After two weeks they have to show me and Mr. Saulnier a progress report from teachers not only attendance, but effort and class participation then students are eligible to participate and be academically eligible. We also reach out to students with 75 or below or have a couple of D's., and share the information with parents to tell the students to come see us so they have a plan in place and academic success.

Mr. Smith added there was some concern about passing the motion at the time because Mr. Arria and I wanted to work with the coaches first for their support and then bring it to the teaching staff so they

would know that they are part of the eligibility process but the Committee wanted to move ahead faster. We all want kids going to programs at our school that lead to post-secondary success.

Ms. Nolan stated that we heard from five coaches that support the change. We did not hear any opposition from teachers.

Mr. Fantini said you had a system in place before we changed. Does this new structure need more budgetary support? Are we doing the same? Mr. Saulnier is a stipend position which doesn't seem to be enough.

Mr. Smith replied there are some benefits and challenges. The academic coordinator has been in place for two years which we did not have in place before that. There are challenges whether one academic coordinator can give the support that a number of our athletes may need help with. There is some room to grow in terms of providing individualized support. There is some accountability for the students too. If we expanded the parameters for student support and hire more tutors, that is something that we could not handle through the CRLS discretionary budget. Maybe Mr. Arria has some funds in athletics.

Mr. Fantini asked how will the new system engage parents.

Mr. Smith stated that the way he understood it was we are developing the new system together and as the Sub-Committee meets we can develop how to communicate with care givers and families. We may need to hire additional tutors and need funding for that. Tutoring may not be the only thing we need. We may need some sports consultants, social emotional counselors, a stronger support system. He thinks he can handle some with the discretionary funds but would come to the Committee for additional funds if needed.

Mr. Grassi put together some guidelines/suggestions. If a student plays Fall sports they need to be kept on track. Sports is a guideline for some of them and it is an easy way to fall off. Make sure grades are kept up throughout the year and not just during the sport season. Freshmen and JV kids start not being on target. Teachers need to sign off when on probation. More cooperation of all people in the schools.

Mr. Escallon thinks the teammates need to be informed because it is easier to engage when it is a friend/brother, however, a student may not want the whole team to know if they aren't doing good in school

Mr. Grassi added to provide the students with the same guidelines we want them to be involved in sports for all 4 years not just 2-3 years. The goal is to make sure kids out of season keep those standards. Maybe tell kids you won't be eligible if your grades keep up falling. Treat all teams equitably. The basketball team has a regular study hall throughout the season. When I played soccer and lacrosse there weren't supports. Offer tutors regularly throughout the year will be helpful.

Ms. Nolan noted that those are great suggestions. Please give to Ms. Gist in writing. You were sensitive to acknowledge if someone was falling behind.

Mr. Smith stated that there are a number of things that the students have put forward and are in line with what we have. How do we keep a student that is out of season engaged? There are other non-high school leagues that students are involved with. We want sports to be the hook to bring them into

other co-curricular activities. The athletic department does not have responsibility if student's grades drop during the off season. We do have off season football programs and a weight lifting program. We can partner on and extend the opportunity for coaches to be part of this Sub-Committee. We need to think about study halls across the spectrum. The school can recommend that the coaches do that. I need some coaches here to see how we can make it happen. Maintain the program. How do we talk to students/teams that may need academic support? The lacrosse team had time set aside time to talk about toxic masculinity but that took a lot of time away from practicing. How do we get everyone involved? It is a challenge to have meetings after school. Having a support plan in name only won't work. What changes can we bring in for year 3 and 4 to support all of our teams equitably.

Ms. Nolan sees one coach here. Were coaches advised of this meeting? It sounds like there was not an explicit invitation.

Mr. Smith do you want us to invite one or two coaches?

Ms. Nolan said only School Committee members can be on the Sub-Committee she will confer with Mr. Kimbrough and figure out how to include more voices.

Mr. Escallon asked so Mr. Smith and Mr. Arria are not members of the Sub-Committee?

Ms. Nolan said only School Committee Members can be on the Sub-Committee but we can create a task force so others can be on the Committee.

Mr. Escallon added if we can all participate in the conversation that would be great.

Mr. Fantini what is the role of the Deans in the houses as far as helping with academics? Is this only an athletic function?

Mr. Smith thinks there is a role for the Deans to be involved. He thinks the task force is the way to go, having more voices at the table is better. In the school community around grades in general there is a tension point threshold of a 70 and what goes into a 70 GPA, related to proficiency. There needs to be a larger conversation with Deans and Teachers around grades. F's are a 50. From 50-70 is a 20-point differential, however there aren't many F's on report cards now. What does a 65 mean in eligibility in proficiency and skill development? All staff need a deeper conversation of what is in that grade.

Mr. Fantini what is going on in the upper schools intermurals?

Mr. Arria responded that we maintained the structure when he arrived 4 years ago sport. There are one or two who complete at their school and some sports set up tournaments to play each other. It varies, right now we do cross county, basketball, orienteering, and soccer. Everybody has to be on the same page at the schools. If we do competitive interscholastic's do kids get cut, do we have time, and a space? We are limited because buildings are used for after school programs.

Mr. Fantini stated if a student has a 50 they can take courses in the summer to increase their grade. If kids can take a course in the summer do they get credit recovery?

Mr. Smith yes and the grade goes on the transcript for that year.

Mr. Fantini we talked about student leaders a few years ago. Is that still in the works?

Mr. Arria responded that he would like a student leadership program but it is hard to fit into the day. There is funding that would be helpful, expand the athletic dept. that would be ok. We did something last year during CM but it was not enough time. We did 2 meetings per month. At the league level I have been chairing a group that do some leadership workshops twice a year where each school sends 10-12 students to participate.

Ms. Liss asked in expanding the support network for kids with 60-70 and if some kids are lagging at 75, if that number were to come up how many kids would be on the radar and how do we reach more kids for support?

Mr. Arria there are quite a few students that are in the 75 number. When it was lowered to 60 I knew it would affect maybe 7-10 kids. Depending on how robust we want to be it takes personnel, resources and someone who can follow up daily with kids. Maybe 60 kids fall 75-85. I'm willing to make athletics accessible to as many kids as possible. We have 20-40 events per week with busses, coaches and other personnel. If that is the expectation, we need to decide on what resources we have so we have a robust program as possible.

Ms. Liss saw the new probation in the DYK newsletter. Is there any printed flyer about the program? Will it be provided on paper to bring home so it reaches more people?

Mr. Smith responded there is still some of our population that use paper but it is easier to do it electronically. We do encourage 9th graders to try out for things they may not think they are fit for. We don't advertise that way but it's a good idea to send to all community caregivers, with data attached, saying being involved in sports increases your chances of going to college.

Mr. Arria stated that we provide a handout every season with eligibility standards every year. We do a night when 8th grade parents come in and visit 8th grade classes and give handouts. We put flyers up at the school and on twitter.

Mr. Smith stated are we doing enough to attract diverse kids who may not consider themselves to be on a team. In general, we speak to a group of kids. Some say that is not for me and we know sometimes there are other factors involved. We are trying to change their concept of honor student we can also apply it to athletics.

Ms. Liss added in the freshman guide there are a lot of student voices.

Ms. Nolan stated this is a larger conversation, many sports have cut policies and we don't want to have more students that are cut.

Ms. Nolan opened the floor for the public to speak.

Mr. Galluccio stated that this should not be adversarial. We don't want to lose the message. People got caught up in the number. I agree with what Mr. Smith says but on specific issues we might disagree. If you put the GPA number aside. I'd like to see kids flagged at a 75. We all want to communicate better, more interventions, more supports, inspire better and utilize coaches. Coaches have an opportunity to

play a different role to hold kids to higher standards. Teachers want control, authority, and be able to tell the coach I want you to be able to validate what happened in my classroom today. This is not about resources, it's about communication, working together and acknowledging we are here for the betterment of the kids. What is your plan for academics, what will you do to make this a priority? There are times when I want to call a teacher or coach and ask do you know if there is something going on. We need to be sharing that information. How can we do this better? The middle school sports are important and student's being held accountable to academics with supports and good study habits. Have another student speak to Freshmen and tell them how he gets his homework done speak. The hardest part is Parent intervention and Coaches building a relationship with them is most important. Coaches can get more information then can push the kid harder. How to better connect with family's needs to be shared between teachers, coaches, guidance counselors. Probation is great it makes everybody stop and say we have a problem and the intervention works so the kid is successful.

Ms. Nolan reminded people that the policy has been changed we have moved forward and this is a check in to see how it's going if we need to make adjustments. This is not only for student athletes but for all students that need support.

Mr. Childs thanked the Sub-Committee for the attention to this and hopes the task force is created. In 2014 the DOE changed the laws around suspension zero tolerance did not work. The MiAA should have been more active in the suspension policy in athletics. There has been steady progress and that's exciting. This in not only about the four students that were not eligible but there are other kids that didn't even bother to try out. Students knew something was wrong when students were cut out. Wrap around services and the supports, social emotional issues and how can that be imbedded into sports.

Ms. Nolan appreciates his involvement in FOCA and this process. She appreciates the update regarding the policy implementation and where communication has been made. We will discuss a task force and involve other people. Our written policy on our website needs to be updated carefully and comprehensively. Communicating on the benefits of sports requires more communication.

Mr. Fantini moved for adjournment at 3:57 PM.

10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence): None

11. Announcements:

The Mayor announced the following:

On this upcoming Thursday, March 21, 2019 at 5:30 p.m will be the fourth Cambridge Digs Deep conversation with Dr. Amante.

There was a very successful city wide little league baseball clinic last Saturday, it was well attended and there will be another one this upcoming Saturday. The clinics are held from 5:30-7:30, and there will be a total of three clinics at the field house for ages 7-12.

Pro bono work for immigrants that are seeking support will come from the Cambridge Legal Defense fund for immigrants between Somerville and Cambridge.

Mr. Fantini stated that there is a lack of coaches for the girls little league softball. This is very sad because without coaches they are going to close.

Ms. Nolan shouted out to Mayor McGovern for the central baseball league, the kids that never played before were able to try out. 140 kids showed up.

12. Late Orders: None

13. Communications from City Officers:

Distributed Back-up Documents (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- Agenda
- Family Engagement Partnership in Action: The Mind Matters PowerPoint presentation

Statements from Public Hearing (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- Needs-Based Analysis of FY19 and FY20 Paraprofessional District Budget Allocation
- Preliminary Analysis of Grade 1-5 General Education Classroom Staffing Data
- Drs. Laura Holsen and Sunny Gupta
- Beverly Seidenberg
- Melissa Tremblay Brimmer & Katie Lynch
- Caitlin O'Donnell

E-Mail communications (copies on file in the School Committee office)


- Kennedy-Longfellow Community
- Carrie Jung
- Sarah Branz
- Jennifer Richards
- Kris Dickson
- Dan Monahan
- Jennifer Wilson
- Mary Shillue-Goldberg
- Lauren K. Gibbs
- Ana Carolina Villar
- Missy Page
- Tomoko Hamaji
- Nancy Wyse
- Bill Boehm
- David Whelan

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to adjourn (9:20 p.m.)

Cambridge School Committee
Regular Meeting
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

March 19, 2019

Attest:



Dosha Beard
Executive Secretary

** At the conclusion of the Regular Meeting, there will be a Special Meeting of the School Committee for the purpose of a Budget Workshop in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of a review of the proposed FY 2020 Budget.*