



**C A M B R I D G E
S C H O O L C O M M I T T E E**

(Official Minutes)

Regular Meeting

February 5, 2019

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan, Mayor McGovern

Also Present: Mr. Grassi, Mr. Escallon, Student School Committee Representatives

Mayor McGovern in the Chair

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

1. Public Comment:

The following individuals were heard:

Dan Monahan, Lexington Ave, #19-15, - School Schedules, negotiation is needed with the Cambridge Education Association (CEA) and they will take no position until they see some strong language representing their rights. The School Committee's job is to make sure the support and funding is in place and the families and out of school time partners agree. He spoke about block schedules and commuting back and forth from home to work. Regarding #19-28, he supports the efforts to hold people accountable on issues, and suggested that we proceed with caution and take Dr. Amante's words on norms – be open to challenging yourself with positive intent - seriously.

Tanya Augustine, Wheatland St, Somerville, #19-15, opposed to Extended Day to school schedules, has been teaching in CPS since 2002, she read a detailed narrative of her various duties, tasks and responsibilities adding that she takes classes to remain current in her science teaching career. When teachers are frustrated it takes a large toll on them, adding more time to the work day will not improve anything.

Eileen Gagnon, Tobin Math coach, #19-15, in favor of Extended Day, she read a statement on file in the School Committee office.

Erin Gutierrez, #19-15, is in favor of Extended Day, it allows more time for them to see about their students. Especially the ones that need extended time for learning

Karen Dobak, Allston Street, parent of two children, CPAC parent, #19-15 strongly supports Extended Day. Students with special needs will benefit the most, when these students are pulled out of classes, it affects them negatively. There are low expectations for children with special needs. Adding more Paraprofessionals will not fix this dynamic. There needs to be teacher training to ensure success.

Alice Cohen, Lexington Ave, Lead Teacher for Social Emotional Learning for CPS #19-15, in support of Extended Day, there is a large amount of stress this agenda item is causing. Stressed adults do not perform well, take losing your keys as an example; all you can think about is that you have lost your keys. Soon you are amped up. For teachers the day feels like living in a world of lost keys. How we get adults to function at their best is to give them more collaborative time. Using the collective wisdom in this room, we should be able to figure out a way for everyone to benefit.

Hitomi Abe, Community Engagement Team (CET), Western Ave, partners with CPS, **#19-15**, gave feedback from families regarding the Extended Day, explaining what the outreach workers do; most live in Cambridge, she made it clear this is not all families however, most support **#19-15**. She broke it down by nationality: a significant amount of Bangladesh families support the Extended Day and want to see the time spent on extra homework supports, and personal attention, the Arabic community wants more academic learning and SEL, and have concerns that the start time is too early, the Haitian families want to see more academic learning, SEL, and sports and have concerns about the cost for afterschool programs, among the Spanish speaking families, they hope the extra time will be used for math, science, emotional supports, religion, and mindfulness and some are concerned about afterschool costs. Black families want to know how it will support closing the achievement gap.

Jane Hershey, Rindge Ave, City Sprouts Program, **#19-15**, supports the Extended Day; it gives students the chance to do more Gardening science, which takes time. She is in favor of the extended day to give more time for these kinds of lessons for 45 minutes four days a week. It will mean less hurried learning time for students and breathing room for teachers to collaborate.

Councilor E. Denise Simmons, Harvard Street, in support of **#19-28**, for an investigation of the incident that happened and shocked many people. A number of people have approached her and are very surprised that we are not more intentional about making sure we do not let these things happen. She is greatly offended. She is not calling for condemnation, but it should be harnessed.

Ellen Semenovoff, Bryant Street, **#19-15**, supports the Extended Day proposal, she applauds the work the Superintendent has done to get feedback from the community, she does not want the afterschool program to become a homework center, and is excited about building the partnership between the Department of Human Services and CPS.

Chris Lim, Pleasant Street, Baldwin parent, **#19-15**, is opposed to Extended Day. He wants to get his child through a school day with a joy of learning; if the day is extended he worries that the joy will leave. The early release day one day per week will disrupt home life and it will turn great teachers into tired teachers, adding that going this far without any approval from the CEA is awkward.

Mary Goldberg, Clifton Street, she supports **#19-15**, Extended Day for lunch and recess. The need for recess does not end in first grade. If you grew up in the US, you will know that recess has been cut back a lot. Recess is good for our vision and exercise.

Saija Scott, supports the **#19-28** Investigation motion, her class has been doing this research. She would like an investigation in order to allow all to know the whole story of what happened. She does not want there to be another opportunity for this to happen again, it can become the norm and everyone will be expected to be fine with it.

Grace Austin, **#19-28**, on behalf of the student body, supports this investigation motion as a stepping stone. There are concerns that this issue was not addressed immediately. The pain should be acknowledged. It was ironic that it is banned yet used while speaking about the ban. Representatives should be held accountable and should not be this ignorant as to the amount of pain it will cause. There needs to be transparency and next steps after the investigation.

Kevin Dua, History teacher and Black Student Union Advisor, supports motion **#19-28**, he always encourages student's voices and tries to insure they are not only integrated but also validated. The students in his class felt that their work and their voices were invalidated when the Member that happened to be White used the full word. Their space felt tainted. So far, only one point of view is looked at and their identity does not matter. Mr. Dua used the actual word in his complaint of the White Member for using the actual word.

Karen Engels, Wendall Street, spoke on **#19-15**, extended day, does not know whether she is for or against the proposal, she wants to make sure the process is one that does not become divisive. She doesn't really want her child in an extended day, but she realizes that teachers need more time together

but parents want more time for learning. School time is only ½ of an educators work day. They need to know what responsibility is being lightened.

Jane Donohue, Chestnut Street, CRLS parent, in support of **#19-28**, students have been testifying for a long time about micro and macro aggressions and racism; and this motion offers a chance for the Restorative Justice Framework to be used and is in line with the District Plan. Everyone can move forward with healing.

Former Mayor Ken Reeves, President of the Cambridge branch of the NAACP, began speaking on **#19-15**, the extended day, what he sees missing is any reference to the actual science of experience with prior students. What happened to the information on the success of the FMA, it must have some valuable data. On the issue of **#19-28**, he is interested in the facts. There are various versions of what happened. There is a letter from this one and a tape from that one. He needs to know the whole story. He directed some comments to the students of color and asked these students to turn to the NAACP for help.

Darren Korle, Calendar Street, Cambridge Community Center, **#19-15**, is concerned about the lack of the data collection of this proposal and is looking for the supporting data. He is asking everyone to slow down a little bit.

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to close public comment.

2. Student School Committee Report:

Mr. Escallon reported that the students do not feel represented as it relates to motion **#19-28**. The article in the Cambridge Day was skewed in one direction. Dr. Salim wrote something that had nothing do with their perspective. They were not given the opportunity to tell their side of what happened.

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Dexter, on a voice vote, it was voted to accept the January 15, 2019 Minutes as presented.

4. Reconsiderations: None

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:

Motion by Mr. Kimbrough from the floor by, that the School Committee send a letter to the high school teacher that received a threatening note and resigned because of not feeling safe. C19-018, 1/15/19 (Bowman)

Discussion followed on **C19-018**.

Mr. Kimbrough stated that this is an important motion, especially with what we have on the Agenda tonight. A teacher was threatened by a racist message at school. It does not feel good to let this go by without any action.

Ms. Bowman motioned, Mr. Fantini seconded, to refer **C19-018** to the Superintendent and Legal Counsel. On a voice vote, Order **C19-018** was referred, with Mr. Kimbrough voting Nay.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, the Rules were suspended to bring item **#19-28** forward for discussion.

#19-28, Motion by Ms. Bowman, whereas the Cambridge School Committee is committed to supporting an educational environment that affirms learning for all students; and Whereas the City of Cambridge Rules of the School Committee Addendum Committee Norms states, it is the School Committee's responsibility to set the tone for the entire school system, and the Committee will

make every effort to promote a positive image for our school system, and the Committee will operate transparently and respectfully to maintain confidentiality and respect the Open Meeting laws; and Whereas it was brought to the attention of the School Committee by students and CPSD staff that there was an incident on January 10, 2019, in a classroom involving a School Committee Member using language that was reported to have made a number of students uncomfortable which called into question the core norms of the School Committee; and

Whereas there have been discussions regarding this incident within CPSD, yet there has been no formal investigative process regarding the incident and the circumstances surrounding it; and Whereas the School Committee is the legislative body of the Cambridge Public School District and is the only entity within the district to move such a process of investigation forward regarding an incident between a School Committee Member and students; therefore, be it

Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize the Human Resource Department to do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures outlined in section III, IV, V of the Non- Discrimination policy, and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee determine next steps based on the report and take appropriate actions regarding the findings; and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee works with the Disruptive Equity Education Project (DEEP), who currently consults with CPSD and the City of Cambridge on equity and dismantling systemic oppression and racism, to give recommendations to the School Committee, educators and students regarding the incident that took place on January 10th, 2019.

Discussion followed on **#19-28**.

Ms. Bowman stated that she brought this motion forward to hear the facts. It happened two weeks before she heard about it. The students have been complaining that we do not listen to them. She feels it is important to listen to the voices of our students. We hold the district and the educators to a certain standard and this motion is to hold ourselves (School Committee) to the same standards that we hold the staff to. She mentioned that she reached out to the Member before writing the motion; this motion is not a surprise to the Member.

Mayor McGovern read a statement (on file in the School Committee office), adding that he feels awful about what happened. He supports the motion by Ms. Bowman and suggested that the Governance Sub-Committee needs to create something to guide us in our Rules.

Vice Chair Kelly thanked Ms. Bowman for bringing this forward. She suggested bringing someone in from the outside may be good for investigative purposes. She thanked Mr. Antonio Escallon for his comments, it is important to know how the students feel. She agrees the School Committee has moved too slowly, it makes the students feel more vulnerable. The impacts on those that were present, who know the whole story, have the upper hand; the Committee does not have the whole story. Vice Chair Kelly is interested in knowing all of what happened to restore normalcy to those affected.

Ms. Nolan stated that she is in favor of an investigation to understand the whole context. She read an excerpt of an email from Janet Moses in support of Committee Member Dexter (on file in the School Committee office). She also read a letter from Bob Moses in support of Emily Dexter (on file in the School Committee office). Ms. Nolan makes is clear that these are not her words, but rather a matter of public record; she wanted to make sure these two letters were heard. In her own words, she feels we need to make sure we are open to hearing the acknowledgement of hurt and we also have to make sure to be open and acknowledge the apology whether butchered or not. We need to be open to discussing and disagreeing without being judged.

Mr. Grassi voiced his support of motion **#19-28** because he believes the students deserve the respect and accountability provided by this motion. It is an opportunity for reflection and education and a long term lesson for CPS and the community.

Mr. Fantini stated he supports **#19-28** and that it speaks to one Member and to all Members. Student voice is important. When they use their voice, we have to listen to them.

Ms. Bowman reiterated that motion **#19-28** is to gather all of the facts so that we can do the required due diligence and hold all of ourselves accountable and move forward. She has no intention to make the Member a villain. Ms. Bowman made it clear she was not happy with her colleague's choice of reading letters that were, in her opinion, inappropriate and tone deaf.

Mayor McGovern wants to know who is going to do the investigation. The Human Resources Department does not have the authority to evaluate the controversial activity of an elected official. The Chair suggested the School Committee hire an outside person to investigate it. He referenced how the Cambridge Police Department handled an incident with a Harvard Law student of color in a police confrontation.

On a motion by Mayor McGovern, seconded by Ms. Bowman, to amend the language from the **Human Resources Department to an outside entity**, on a voice vote, with Committee Member Dexter voting PRESENT, the **amendment was adopted**: Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize **an outside entity** do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures...

Mr. Kimbrough motioned an amendment to the third paragraph, referencing the work of author Randall Kennedy, stating there are more than a few ways to use the N word. It can be quoted, Mr. Kimbrough used the actual word to quote the name of a book, adding it can also be used with the power and history of the word itself to oppress someone. He was there on January 10th, when Committee Member Dexter quoted the word and there is huge difference between the two.

Mr. Kimbrough motioned, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to amend the third paragraph to change the language from **using to quoting** language that made.... On the following, roll call, **the amendment failed of adoption**: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman NAY; Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly NAY; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mayor McGovern NAY.

Committee Member Dexter stated she supports the motion and read a statement of her actions and her sorrow (on file in the School Committee office).

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Mr. Fantini, on a voice vote, with Committee Member voting PRESENT, item **#19-28 as amended was adopted**: whereas the Cambridge School Committee is committed to supporting an educational environment that affirms learning for all students; and Whereas the City of Cambridge Rules of the School Committee Addendum Committee Norms states, it is the School Committee's responsibility to set the tone for the entire school system, and the Committee will make every effort to promote a positive image for our school system, and the Committee will operate transparently and respectfully to maintain confidentiality and respect the Open Meeting laws; and Whereas it was brought to the attention of the School Committee by students and CPSD staff that there was an incident on January 10, 2019, in a classroom involving a School Committee Member using language that was reported to have made a number of students uncomfortable which called into question the core norms of the School Committee; and Whereas there have been discussions regarding this incident within CPSD, yet there has been no formal investigative process regarding the incident and the circumstances surrounding it; and Whereas the School Committee is the legislative body of the Cambridge Public School District and is the only entity within the district to move such a process of investigation forward regarding an incident between a School Committee Member and students; therefore, be it Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize **an outside entity** to do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures outlined in section III, IV, V of the Non- Discrimination policy, and be it further Resolved that the School Committee determine next steps based on the report and take appropriate actions regarding the findings; and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee works with the Disruptive Equity Education Project (DEEP), who currently consults with CPSD and the City of Cambridge on equity and dismantling systemic oppression and racism, to give recommendations to the School Committee, educators and students regarding the incident that took place on January 10th, 2019.

The Chair declared a five minute recess at 7:55 p.m. The time for recess having expired, the Chair reconvened the meeting at 8:00 p.m. and returned to the regular order of business.

6. Awaiting Reports: None

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

**7a. Presentations: Improving School Schedules to Advance Equity.....Kenneth N. Salim,
Superintendent of Schools
CPS Principals**

Dr. Salim walked the Members through the presentation. The Principals gave very informative remarks and shared positive details that enhanced the presentation (on file in the School Committee office, and online located on the School Committee webpage with the Agenda, Notice and Video for the night).

Some of the questions, comments and concerns on the presentation included:

Ms. Nolan is curious about the one hour early release as opposed to the 6 ½ hours every day.

Dr. Salim explained that they looked at different models. There may be no early release days; consistency would be easier to plan for. They cannot depend on a system that all Educators cannot participate in.

Mr. Grassi appreciates the intent to concentrate on more learning time. He also supports the suggestions for the transition times, it is hard to get around depending on where your next class is. Community Meetings are 15 or 20 minutes, which is a great opportunity to see your classmates but it is rushed. Later start times will go a long way for students that are not morning people and it may be worth considering. Club participation is usually in the mornings, and a later start time could increase club membership.

Ms. Bowman wants to hear from the two models of extended day. She also wants to know what other districts with shorter school days are doing.

Mayor McGovern stated that in therapeutic schools, the system worked consistently with an early release day every Wednesday. On that day, they shared information and looked at the data.

Morse School Principal Chad Leith stated that they have Professional Development on early release days. The week works well and the days fly by.

Committee Member Dexter stated the timeline slide requires two votes for a policy change. This is a first reading and then it will come back again for a second reading. On the second vote she suggested that the Members authorize bringing it to collective bargaining in order to try to implement it.

Dr. Salim stated that the district and the negotiating team will benefit from questions. It is not only about authorization to move forward, but also to figure out compensation and distribution of professional time.

Committee Member Dexter suggested that it is brought back to the community also.

Mr. Kimbrough does not want the families of color to be left out of the conversations on this issue. What families of color may have to give up is probably more than what middle income and White families will have to give up by extending the school day by 45 minutes.

Ms. Bowman asked for clarification on what happens after it goes to the first reading, then the second reading. The negotiating process may change the recommendations of the two prior votes.

Mayor McGovern explained this is a step in the process on its way to bargaining with the intention to keep things pretty much the same as they appear tonight by the time the negotiating and bargaining are completed.

Ms. Nolan thinks this can be an exciting opportunity for us based on the Theory of Action, quality improves the use of time, quantity and access.

Mayor McGovern spoke on the either or situation, of extending or adding more teachers. He feels it should be the and situation by doing both. He also wants to make sure we reach out to the vulnerable people and make sure they are brought into the conversations.

Vice Chair Kelly stated that it is valuable to have heterogeneous classrooms as a way of building true community in our schools.

Committee Member Dexter emphasized that she is concerned about cost; transportation is huge and she is unclear about where this money will come from and also asked for a transportation model on a single start time and on a single end time. The sample being 8:15 a.m. and 3:10 p.m.

Ms. Nolan commented that she has done the research and recognizes that extended time should not all be academic it should also include recess.

The Chair worries about passing an expense to parents that cannot afford to have a half day every week. The burden may be too much. He also wonders how we can say we want to do add time and we don't know what the time will be used for. He would rather take a year of implementation and a clear picture of the time spent.

The meeting returned to the presentation. Dr. Salim spoke about staffing and time. These two issues do not address the fragmented schedules of some students, and it doesn't address many other issues. The original early release proposal was one hour, forty five minutes and that has been changed to one hour to lessen the impact to families. The presentation ended with no additional discussion.

7b. CPS District Plan:

7c. Consent Agenda:

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to bring the Superintendent's Agenda forward for discussion and adoption.

Mayor McGovern removed **19-15**. Mr. Fantini removed **19-16**. Ms. Nolan removed **19-20** and **19-21**. On the following roll call vote, items **#19-17, #19-18, #19-19, #19-22, to #19-26** were adopted: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

#19-17, Special Needs Contracts for Day and Residential Program Services not Available from the Cambridge School Department, that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget and/or Grant Fund Budget.

	<u>#</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Day Program Tuition Contracts	4	\$158,942.28
Residential Program Tuition Contracts	0	
45 Day Program Contracts	<u>0</u>	
Total	4	<u>\$158,942.28</u>

#19-18, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Medicaid Reimbursement Claiming Services, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Public Consulting Group, 148 State Street, 10th Floor, Boston, for the period July 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$97,750.00.

#19-19, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for interactive hardware, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:
CCS Presentation Systems, 132 Northeastern Blvd., Nashua, NH, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2020, in the amount of \$50,000.00.

#19-22, Approval of Gifts to Cambridge Public Schools, that the School Committee accept and approve the following gifts and receipts as described.

An in-kind donation made from an individual donor of an Alto Saxophone for the Visual and Performing Arts Department.

1. A gift of \$800.00 made to Vassal Lane Upper School by Phillips Brooks House Association as thanks for hosting summer camp.
2. A gift of \$600 made to CRLS by Harvard University as thanks for hosting an instructional rounds group from Harvard Graduate School of Education.
3. A gift of \$1,500.00 made to Vassal Lane Upper School by Biogen Foundation as a prize for the seventh grade winning second place in a Science Competition.
4. A gift of \$1,000 made to CRLS by the Laura A. Piasecki Charitable Trust.

#19-23, Grant Award, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:

FY19 Massachusetts Cultural Council STARRS Project/Grant SC19894, in the amount of \$13,800.00 for the period February 23, 2019 to June 30, 2019.

Description: This year the MCC grants will support residency cultural series at the Amigos (\$5,000 for Dance in the Schools); Cambridgeport (\$4,200 for Underground Railroad Theatre); Baldwin (\$1,800 for Town Meeting/Freedom Trail Foundation); and Rindge Ave Upper School (\$2,800 for the Art of Biomimicry with Kyle Browne).

#19-24, Grant Award, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:

Emergency impact Aid for Homeless Students Project/Grant SC19155, in the amount of \$875.00 for the period February 28, 2019 to August 31, 2019.

Description: This grant will be used to provide winter clothing and public transportation for students displaced to our district from Puerto Rico and the USVI as a result of hurricanes.

#19-25, Grant Award, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award below in the amount and for the period indicated:

MIT Project/Grant SC19154, in the amount of \$500.00 for the period January 28, 2019 to June 30, 2019.

Description: This grant will be used in conjunction with a grant from the IBM Corporation to purchase a 3D printer for the Kennedy Longfellow computer Lab which will support the Ed Tech Curriculum on design thinking and modeling.

#19-26, Grant Award, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award below in the amount and for the period indicated:

Lesley University/Biogen Foundation STAR Initiative Project/Grant SC19159, in the amount of \$50,000.00 for the period December 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019.

Description: A sub-award from Lesley University.

8. Non-Consent Agenda:

#19-15, Approval of Proposal to Improve School Schedules to Advance Equity, that the School Committee approve the proposal to improve school schedules to advance equity (first reading).

Discussion followed on **#19-15**.

Mr. Fantini stated he is not in favor of **#19-15**. It has taken up a lot of discussion, and has caused a lot of dissent in our schools. He asked for a roll call in order to be noted as voting NAY.

Ms. Nolan indicated it is only a first reading, suggested having conversations to move it forward. On the following roll call vote, **#19-15** was referred to a second reading: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

#19-16, Authorization for the Superintendent to Submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form dated February 15, 2019 for the Morse School Building Located at 40 Granite Street. Recommendation: That in accordance with the requirements of the Massachusetts School Building Authority the School Committee enter an order containing the following resolution:

Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 5, 2019, the Cambridge School Committee of Cambridge, Massachusetts, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form no later than February 15, 2019 for the Morse School located at 40 Granite Street, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: The funds are sought to be used for the replacement of the building's roof. The Granite Street building's roof is more than twenty-three years old and has multiple failures. This project falls under priority category number 5, which is for the replacement, renovation, or modernization of school facility systems, such as roofs, windows, boilers, heating and ventilation systems, to increase energy conservation and decrease energy related costs in a school facility, as determined in the judgment of the Authority. The Cambridge School Committee hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance of the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the City of Cambridge to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority.

Discussion followed on **#19-16**.

It was stated that once the School Committee votes tonight, item **#19-16** will be put on the City Council Agenda for approval before it goes to the Building Authority. On the following roll call vote, item **#19-16** was adopted: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

On a motion from Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote. The Rules having been suspended for the purpose stated; a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, on a unanimous voice vote, failed of adoption.

#19-20, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Mold Remediation and Pipe Insulation Services, funds to be provided from the Revolving Fund, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Lothrop Companies, 30 Winter Street, Malden, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$35,000.00.

#19-21, Contract Award, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Mold Remediation and Pipe Insulation Services, funds to be provided from the Revolving Fund, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

24 Restore, 10 Church Street, South Easton, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$30,000.00.

Discussion followed on **#19-20 and #19-21**.

Mr. Maloney stated that the air quality is fine at the Baldwin, Peabody and the Morse. There are high mold readings and high water intrusion in the walls at the Baldwin. They will remove some of the walls during the February break and hopefully that will clear up the issue.

Ms. Nolan asked for clarification if there was a separate issue of mold last year that had to be fixed. Mr. Maloney stated that it is all part of the same problem.

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Mr. Kimbrough, to bring forward all items for discussion and adoption.

Ms. Nolan pulled **#19-27**

#19-27, Motion by Mr. Fantini, that the School Committee authorize the Superintendent to mail to all eighth grade families the attached brochure that is used by our SOLVED partner, The Medford Vocational Technical High School, subject to any revisions the Superintendent deems necessary.

Discussion followed on **#19-27**.

Ms. Nolan asked for clarification on whether the mailing is going to be distributed through backpacks along with using the postal system.

It was indicated that both would be preferable. On a voice vote, item **#19-27** was adopted.

#19-29, The Report of the January 22, 2019 Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) Hearing was accepted as presented:

**Budget Sub-Committee Hearing
School Committee Conference Room
January 22, 2019
3:30 – 5:30 p.m.**

Called for the purpose of a Public Hearing inviting the input of Educators and Members of the Community regarding the FY20 School Department Budget Priorities.

Members Present: Mayor McGovern (**ABSENT**), Ms. Bowman (**ABSENT**), Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan (**ABSENT**), Ms. Kelly (**ABSENT**), and Mr. Kimbrough (**ABSENT**), Ms. Nolan (**ABSENT**).

Also Present: Dr. Salim, Dr. Turk, Dr. Adams, Ms. MacDonald, Ms. Spinner, Ms. Allen, Mr. DeJesus, Mr. Monahan, Ms. Liss

Mr. Fantini in the chair, a quorum of the Sub-Committee being present Mr. Fantini called the meeting to order at 3:52 PM and read the call of the meeting.

Public Comment:

Dan Monahan, CEA President: Lexington Ave and Parent of CRLS Junior. There needs to be greater transparency and equity with regard to elementary staffing and class size information which was requested from Administration but is incomplete. Allocation of funds to co-create a K-12 Equity Action Network to figure out ways to release teachers from some of their work without sacrificing the supports our scholars need. We need to better respond to reported incidents and build our capacity with proactive and reactive restorative practices. (comments on file in School Committee office)

Francis Fennell 5th Grade Student at Baldwin: She is not in favor of extending the school day. (comments on file in SC office)

Jen Healy, Nicole Golding, Susan Comstock and Jessica Karwowski representing the Haggerty staff. Priorities are staffing in grades JK-2 they need a second adult with 20 kids in the classroom. Co-teaching to Close the achievement gap, a full time Social Worker, two Building substitutes and additional staffing during less structured times especially in AM with free breakfasts being offered, continue to have access to 2 part-time Interventionists. Maintain the computer lab and library so teachers can use it, fix/replace equipment that is not working well in the building; chrome books, Teacher's computers and old smart boards and projectors. Our Technology person is only ½ time.

Fabiane Noronha, King Open School OLA teacher: Create dual language education, need a 2nd Kindergarten in the new building, she has 20 kids age 4-6 in her classroom, 10 are JK's and it is hard to teach two languages when kids are at different levels. New books and a book room, we have no Portuguese books, teachers are using their free time to translate books and glue them together.

Ana Travasso, King Open School: 5th grade OLA teacher, We start with a full class but because of attrition it is hard for kids to join the class and have the language. Her class is extremely small which is not a good environment because there needs to be a lot of conversation in the class for kids. She wants an additional Kindergarten classroom in the new building which would allow them to pass a full class up to the 2nd and 3rd grade. When they reach 5th grade they love each other. Amigos and King have two Kindergartens so it is an equity thing. They anticipate more of a demand for the Ola Program.

Mary Elizabeth Cranton, CSUS Interventionist and Parent; She supports full time Family Liaisons. She read a statement from Allison Skully another staff member who supports full-time Literacy Interventionists and grade level Adjustment Counselors. If students don't get support they disengage in school over time and Teachers cannot be mental health clinicians. (on file in SC office)

Betsy Preval, CSUS 6th grade ELA teacher: Shares Allison Skully's views that they need more staffing including Counselors, full time Literacy Interventionist, Family Liaisons, Special Educators and Paraprofessionals. They need Lunch Aides because their funds for Lunch Aides were used to hire Mr. Soares. Our two Guidance Counselors are doing lunch duty and are needed elsewhere to support scholars. There should be a Counselor for grades 6, 7 and 8. Specialists and World Language Teachers need in class supports because they are IEP heavy. Behaviors escalate in the arts courses and need more support staff. Her co-teacher is only in her classroom 40% of the week. Administration just approved for a .4 Literacy Interventionist, where are we going to get a dedicated, qualified person? Where is the relationship building for this? She invited everyone to come visit her classroom and see what it's like on a daily basis.

Jen Mason Stott, King Open School Library: Advocating for elementary and Upper School libraries and Paraprofessional staffing. She started as a Paraprofessional and worked her way up. Paraprofessionals are needed because they build trust and provide academic support for students. Out of the 12 elementary schools only four have Paraprofessional support. There is a lot of maintenance of the library materials that the Paraprofessionals can take care of. She read examples of what the Librarians that have Paraprofessionals do. The 3rd graders need handholding to get on the computers and learn. Tobin is unique because of the Montessori Model but she is requesting equity for all libraries and funding for Paraprofessionals.

Caitlin O'Donnell, Teacher at Fletcher Maynard Academy: She shared an excel spreadsheet with Ms. Dexter (on file in SC office) on class size numbers in general education classes. Only four Principals supplied data to her including the Cambridgeport, Fletcher Maynard Academy, Graham & Parks and Tobin Montessori. In general education grades 1 through 5 there is a huge discrepancy in the number of Paraprofessionals to Students ratios, which is shocking and alarming, and ranges from, 1-86 and 1 for 22 students. That is not equity. Some schools have Interns helping them. We need the data and need to look at the best staffed school in the district.

Rose Levine, 5th grade Teacher at Graham & Parks: She wants the budget to prioritize equitable access and outcome in all schools regarding staffing. Early grades are essential for the gaps between the students of color and their white peers. At her school there is a Paraprofessional or Intern in each classroom with the lead Teacher. Every classroom in the District should have two adults. She has a

Paraprofessional in her classroom, which gives her the flexibility to work with some students while the other adult works with another group of students. Provide funding because we need adults to build relationships with the students and they need educators that look like them.

Robyn Towner, Special Educator at King School: Many Special needs students need individualized instruction. More Paraprofessionals are crucial but they are not Teachers and cannot supply services as detailed in a student's IEP unless they are specifically hired by OSS. Additional Special Educators are needed for adequate and equitable student support and to co-teach at grade level. Some Middle Schools have two Special Educators per grade level while in elementary schools Special Educators have 2-3 grade levels. The K-2 Special Educator can have as many as ten classrooms that they need to work with. Typical caseloads for elementary Special Educators is 20+ students. Fragmented work with students is not dependable support for students. 4-6 children in groups is not specialized instruction for each student. Fund additional Special Educators at the elementary level. (on file in SC office).

Ross Benson, CRLS Math Teacher: The district enrollment has increased and the district doesn't know who lives in Cambridge and the High School doesn't look proactively if students live here. Tax dollars should be used for kids that actually live in Cambridge.

Matt Dunkel, King Open Parent and VLUS Teacher: He supports the Equity Action Network because racism and inequity are impacting our young people and is corrosive in our District (on file in SC office). We need a comprehensive network based approach to build connection, solidarity and mutual support across initiatives. Equity work takes place outside of school hours and limits our impact. We need additional resources to fund an Equity Action Network to build Equity across the District.

Ed Walker, CRLS Guidance Counselor: He Supports funding the CEA recommendation for a strong Equity Action Network of educators that allows building based and district wide implementation particularly regarding racial issues, sharing best practices, building common purpose, increasing solidarity and ensuring collective impact that empowers every school, employee and student in a way that this district is capable of. (on file in SC Office)

Michelle Currier and Lilly Martinez Baldwin Teachers: Teachers feel they aren't being heard. It is divisive and she echoes what others have spoken about. They polled the whole school (64 people) and the majority don't want an extended day. Their staff said they need additional staffing in classrooms, more adults in classroom, parking at school, smaller class size, behavior support, social emotional curriculum across the district, pay teachers to tutor after school, more innovative curriculum instruction, more Special Education Teachers with general Education Teachers. Interns are being used for recess duty and they are not ready and should not be considered staff.

Karen Engels, Teacher: She is in favor of funding the Equity Action Team, increase staff in classroom, are Interns needed as staffing? Teachers and Librarians need full time Paraprofessionals, improve the co-teaching collaboration time, with the social emotional issues need more Guidance Counselors and Interventionists. The Elementary Program Review said we don't need more staffing but more time. We need to be included in the conversations.

Superintendent Salim announced that there will be two more public hearings on the Proposed Budget.

Ms. Dexter thanked everyone for coming and apologized for starting late.
Motion to adjourn by Ms. Nolan, second by Mayor McGovern, the meeting ended at 5:03PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Gist
Confidential Secretary to the School Committee

Documents on file in the School Committee Office from the following;
Dan Monahan

Frances Fennell
Haggerty School Staff (Jen Healy, Nicole Golding, Susan Comstock, Jessica Karwowski)
Allison Skully
Robyn Towner
Matt Dunkel
Ed Walker
Rose Levine

10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence):

#19-30, Motion by Mr. Fantini, that the School Committee congratulate Amy Short, Assistant Director for Library Media Services, as a recipient of the 2019 Massachusetts School Library Association Peggy Hallisey Lifetime Achievement Award. This award celebrates Amy's exemplary commitment to the service of students and 21st century learning and to the advancement of school libraries. She is a fierce advocate for our school libraries and their central role in our students' rigorous, joyful, culturally responsive learning experiences. Amy will be honored on Sunday, March 31 during the MSLA Awards Banquet as part of the MSLA Annual Conference, "School Libraries are for Everyone", and That the Executive Secretary is requested to forward a suitable congratulatory letter on behalf of the entire School Committee.

SOURCE: Massachusetts School Library Association

11. Announcements:

Mayor McGovern announced the following:
Cambridge Digs DEEP, Thursday, February 7, 2019 from 5:30-8:00 p.m.
Open Mic Night, Thursday, February 28, 2019 6:00 to 8:00 pm.
CPS has won the opportunity for a chance to submit a proposal for the NSBA spring conference in Philadelphia, PN, CPS accepted and will be presenting issues such as out of school time, how we do our budget process

12. Late Orders: On a unanimous voice vote, it was voted to adopt the following:

Motion by Mr. Fantini, that the School Committee congratulate Mary Grassi for being recognized by the Reading Recovery Council of North America as its "2019 Excellence in Literacy Leadership Award" which is presented by the Reading Recovery teacher leaders. Awards will be presented on Sunday, February 10, during the 2019 National Reading Recovery K-6 Literacy Conference opening session at the Greater Columbus Convention Center.

During her 40 year-career in Cambridge, Mary Grassi has worked as a Substitute Teacher, Classroom, Teacher, Title I Reading Specialist, and Title I Curriculum Coordinator. She has been integral to the development and growth of Reading Recovery in the Cambridge area for the past 25 years. As site coordinator for five school districts, her efforts have helped create a strong model that allows for layers of intervention in response to literacy needs of all children

Mary connects with other Title I Directors across the state, working to ensure financing is available to support training and ongoing professional development for Reading Recovery teaching and implementation. She is a founding member of the Reading Recovery Council of Massachusetts and serves in a variety of roles at the district and state level, receiving numerous awards in her tenure. "Mary Grassi is a tireless advocate for Reading Recovery," said Teacher Leader Karen Tlili who, along with Teacher Leader Maureen Bobbin, nominated Mary. "She knows that having access to Reading Recovery is essential for the children who need it most, and she works to maintain and extend implementation. She sits on the networking committee of the state council, focusing on recruiting new districts and increasing awareness across the state."

SOURCE: Reading Recovery Council of North America

January 9, 2019

https://readingrecovery.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/Literacy_Leadership_Award-2019.pdf

Motion by Mayor McGovern, a resolution on the passing of Ms. Muriel W. Turk.

**--IN SCHOOL COMMITTEE--
February 22, 2019**

- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK, mother of Dr. Carolyn Turk, Deputy Superintendent of the Cambridge Public Schools, passed away peacefully on January 22, 2019 at the age of 100 and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was born in Boston, Massachusetts but moved to Cambridge in 1949 where she raised her family and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was an active member serving multiple roles at her church, The Church of St. Augustine and St. Martin, as well as being a member of the Aristo Club of Boston, an organization of Black professional women who studied and taught Black history and awarded scholarships to Black children and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was a long-time member of the Cambridge Unity Committee, who's primary focus was to advise the City Manager on issues of race and class and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was a public school teacher and active member of the Girl Scouts in Boston and touched the lives of many young people and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK always had a bright and loving smile and possessed a quick wit right up until her passing and*
- WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK will be missed by many, NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT*
- RESOLVED:** *that the Members of the Cambridge School Committee go on record expressing its heartfelt condolences to Dr. Carolyn Turk on the passing of her mother, MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK and BE IT FURTHER*
- RESOLVED:** *that the Executive Secretary of the School Committee send a copy of this resolution to Dr. Carolyn Turk.*

A true copy:

Attest:

Dosha E. Beard

Executive Secretary to the School Committee

Revised 2019 Schedule of Budget Meetings (on file in the School Committee office).

Mr. Fantini explained that the changes are the dates that are in red.

13. Communications from City Officers: None

Distributed Back-up Documents (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- Agenda
- Revised 2019 Schedule of Budget Meetings
- Improving School Schedules to Advance Equity PowerPoint presentation

Statements from Public Comment (copies on file in the School Committee office)


- ✓ Ross Benson, CRLS Math Teacher, #19-15, Extended Day
- ✓ Dan Monahan, CEA President, #19-15 and #19-28, Extended Day and Investigation
- ✓ Jane Donohue, Parent, #19-28, Investigation
- ✓ Mayor McGovern, #19-28, Investigation
- ✓ Councillor E. Denise Simmons, #19-28, Investigation
- ✓ Hope Kelley, #19-15, Extended Day
- ✓ Rebecca Coyne, #19-15 Extended Day
- ✓ Tanya Augustine, #19-15 Extended Day
- ✓ Jane Hirschi, City Sprouts, #19-15, Extended Day
- ✓ Ellen Semonoff, DHSP, #19-15, Extended Day

E-Mail communications (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- ❖ Archy LaSalle, #19-15, Extended Day
- ❖ Martin Benoit, #19-15, Extended Day
- ❖ Rebecca Coyne, #19-15 Extended Day
- ❖ Liz Phipps-Soeiro, #19-28, Investigation
- ❖ Rebecca S. Lester, #19-28 Investigation
- ❖ Councillor Alanna Mallon, #19-28, Investigation
- ❖ Grace Austin, #19-28, Investigation
- ❖ Janet Moses, #19-28, Investigation
- ❖ Bob Moses, #19-28, Investigation

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to adjourn at 9:50 p.m.

Attest:


Dosha Beard
Executive Secretary